

**HERITAGE DEVELOPMENT BOARD
OF
THE CITY OF SAINT JOHN**

WEDNESDAY APRIL 3RD, 2013

The meeting of the Heritage Development Board was held in the 10th Floor Boardroom of City Hall, commencing at 5:25 pm.

IN ATTENDANCE:

Gordon Hewitt, 1st Vice Chair
Patrick McCaffrey, 2nd Vice Chair
Councillor Donna Reardon
Elizabeth McGahan
Scott Rinehart
Bob Boyce

Amy Poffenroth, Acting Commissioner
Alice Fudge, Heritage Analyst
Jill Flecknell, Recording Secretary

REGRETS:

Jim Bezanson, Secretary/Heritage Development Officer
Leona Laracey, Chair
Colin Waldschutz
Alex Pesold

ITEM 1.0 AGENDA

MOVED by Patrick McCaffrey, SECONDED by Donna Reardon, to approve the agenda as presented.

CARRIED.

ITEM 2.0 MINUTES

ITEM 2.1 MINUTES OF THE MARCH 20TH, 2013 MEETING

MOVED by Donna Reardon, SECONDED by Scott Rinehart to approve the March 20th, 2013 minutes as presented.

CARRIED.

ITEM 3.0 BUSINESS ARISING**ITEM 3.1 INTRODUCTION OF NEW HERITAGE BOARD MEMBERS**

Vice Chair, Gord Hewitt introduced and welcomed newly appointed Heritage Board members Scott Rinehart and Bob Boyce. Mr Rinehart and Mr. Bob Boyce provided the Board with a brief background on their interests in the Heritage program and expressed their enthusiasm to serve the next three years as members of the Board.

ITEM 3.2 AWNINGS/WINDOW TREATMENT GUIDELINE DISCUSSION

See discussion under Item 5.3 Decimal 81 c/o Brad Richard, 81 Princess Street.

ITEM 3.3 RESOLUTION OF COMMON COUNCIL RE: ABC'S LETTER

A letter addressed to the Heritage Development Board was circulated regarding the resolution of Common Council which was adopted with respect to the City's ABCs. Donna Reardon explained that it is concerning a Council effort to ensure all ABC's are accountable and that appointments to various Boards are done so with a variety of parameters.

MOVED by Donna Reardon, SECONDED by Patrick McCaffrey to receive and file.

CARRIED.

ITEM 3.4 2012 HERITAGE GRANTS: WEBSITE

Councillor Donna Reardon requested that the list of 2012 grant recipients be posted to the city's website. She explained that it would be to the benefit of the Heritage program as it would create transparency as well as raise awareness to the projects that have received funding for their good work. Acting Commissioner Amy Poffenroth advised that she had confirmed with David Burke, Information Management Officer that the information can be released and placed on the website.

MOVED by Donna Reardon, SECONDED by Patrick McCaffrey to publish the list of 2012 heritage grant recipients on the City of Saint John's website.

CARRIED.

ITEM 4.0 INTRODUCTION OF APPLICANTS/GUESTS

Max Musiyenko & Chris Adams were present representing *Item 5.2 88 Orange Street.*

Carl Killen was present representing *Item 5.1 159-161 Orange Street.*

Jim Bezanson was present representing *Item 5.4 114-116 Wentworth Street, Item 5.5 191 Princess Street & Item 5.7 114-116 Wentworth Street.*

ITEM 5.0 CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS AND GRANTS

**ITEM 5.1A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-08
CARL KILLEN, 159-161 ORANGE STREET**

Alice Fudge advised the application is to remove existing and install new wood clap boards and paint exterior of entire building, including window components and trim, using the approved Heritage color scheme. In response to the March 6th, 2013 meeting Mr. Killen submitted a letter from his tradesman that stating that upon inspection the existing cladding on all sides of the building were found to be deteriorated to the point that the only remedy is replacement. She recommended approval.

**ITEM 5.1B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-08
CARL KILLEN, 159-161 ORANGE STREET**

MOVED by Donna Reardon, *SECONDED* by Patrick McCaffrey to approve the following:

Remove loose and deteriorated paint from existing windows and trim components, using hand scrapers or infrared heat guns. DO NOT USE OPEN FLAME of propane torch (flame may wick into building with disastrous results);

Remove existing wood siding from all sides of the building;

Install pine clapboard siding to all facades, complete with corner boards, plinth boards and fascia boards;

Scrub all surfaces to be painted with TSP (tri-sodium phosphate); rinse thoroughly with clean water; allow surfaces to dry completely prior to painting (typically 3 days);

Prime and paint all wood components using the existing approved colour scheme in keeping with guidelines found in Practical Conservation Guidelines for Paint & Colour.

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;

2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before April 19, 2013.

CARRIED

**ITEM 5.1C APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE CONSERVATION GRANT 13-08
CARL KILLEN, 159-161 ORANGE STREET**

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the application is for a Heritage Conservation Grant to remove existing and install new wood clap boards and paint exterior of entire building, including window components and trim, using the approved Heritage color scheme. A Conservation Plan is in place for the building located in the Orange Street Heritage Conservation Area.

Carl Killen requested that the Board table his grant application pending the submission of a more detailed project estimate. The Board agreed and reminded Mr. Killen to submit the necessary information at his earliest convenience to ensure the project is in the queue for grant funding in 2013.

MOVED by Patrick McCaffrey, SECONDED by Donna Reardon to table a Heritage Conservation Grant for 15% for installation of new wooden clapboards and cement board on the west façade and painting up pending the submission of a full project estimate.

CARRIED.

**ITEM 5.2A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-03B
PAUL JACK C/O MAX MUSIYENKO, 88 ORANGE STREET**

Alice Fudge advised the application is to replace two non-original windows with four new vertical-sliding wood windows in the dormers on the front façade of the building. She recommended approval.

**ITEM 5.2B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-03B
PAUL JACK C/O MAX MUSIYENKO, 88 ORANGE STREET**

MOVED by Donna Reardon, SECONDED by Patrick McCaffrey to approve the following:

Remove two non-original windows from third storey dormers;

Install four new wood vertical sliding windows, which meet egress requirements;

Scrub all surfaces to be painted with TSP (trisodium phosphate); rinse thoroughly with clean water; allow to dry completely prior to painting (typically 3 days);

Prime and paint all wood components using an approved colour scheme in keeping with guidelines found in Practical Preservation Guidelines for PAINT & COLOR.

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before April 19, 2013.

Applicant Max Musiyenko provided an estimate and redesign for new wood windows as per the Board's recommendations made at the January 23, 2013 meeting. The Board had recommended that the owner considers revising the design of the two proposed windows to restore the heritage character of the building by installing, in each of the window openings, two separate wooden windows with a vertical dividing post. Board members were pleased with the changes made to the application.

CARRIED.

**ITEM 5.2C APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE MAINTENANCE GRANT 13-03B
PAUL JACK C/O MAX MUSIYENKO, 88 ORANGE STREET**

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the application is for a Heritage Maintenance Grant to replace two non-original windows with four new vertical-sliding wood windows in the dormers on the front façade of the building. No Conservation Plan is in place for the building located in the Orange Street Heritage Conservation Area. She recommended approval.

Max Musiyenko advised the Heritage Development Board that he had not included labour charges in his grant estimate and requested to amend the total project cost to \$3,918.40 (\$2,000 for labour and \$1918.40 for the windows). The

Board agreed to allow for the labour charges to be added to the maintenance grant application.

MOVED by Patrick McCaffrey, SECONDED by Donna Reardon to approve a Heritage Maintenance Grant of 15% of costs up to \$500.00 to replace two non-original windows with four new vertical-sliding wood windows in the dormers on the front façade of the building.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.3A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-12
DECIMAL 81 C/O BRAD RICHARD, 81 PRINCESS STREET

Alice Fudge advised the application is to install four new storefront awnings on the (South facing) street facade. She recommended approval.

ITEM 5.3B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-12
DECIMAL 81 C/O BRAD RICHARD, 81 PRINCESS STREET

MOVED by Donna Reardon, SECONDED by Patrick McCaffrey to approve the following:

Install four new fabric awnings: two @ 5'10" wide, two @ 5'4" wide, all 3' high and projecting approximately 12" out from the face of the building, complete with lettering and brand image along one front edge flap – lettering [approx 8" high, sans-serif font (Helvetica)] to read:

- “Décimal 81”

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before April 19, 2013.

Ms. Fudge explained to the Board that the application had been tabled at the December 12, 2012 meeting. At that time the Board had developed a

subcommittee to review the Practical Conservation Guideline regarding Awnings, specifically surrounding details such as the requirement for scallop edging, shape, and font, as well as the definition of an awning and the use of contemporary designs. At the February 6th, 2013 meeting Chair Leona Laracey and Patrick McCaffrey circulated a draft document they developed as the subcommittee regarding exterior window treatments and other oddities.

Patrick McCaffrey reviewed with the Board that there was an interpretation that window treatments and awning applications should be handled on a case by case basis. The Board held a brief discussion but agreed with the document prepared by the subcommittee which outlined scenarios where different types of applications may be considered.

Alice Fudge provided her preliminary findings based on the review of Heritage programs in other municipalities such as St. John's, Nfld, Victoria, BC, and Halifax, NS. Ms. Fudge explained that the guidelines should allow for unique contemporary expression within the historic storefront frame work while remaining close to our Practical Conservation Guidelines. Uniqueness she added provides value and character to a streetscape and allows the storefront owner some flexibility in marketing their company. She added that retractable awnings were more common in the past and scalloped edging at that time was used primarily to hide the hardware. The Board expressed that they were in agreement that the awning at Decimal 81 was not distracting from the Heritage qualities of the building and that the awnings would be installed so that they were removable without harming the fabric of the building.

CARRIED

**ITEM 5.3C APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE CONSERVATION GRANT 13-12
DECIMAL 81 C/O BRAD RICHARD, 81 PRINCESS STREET**

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the application is for a Heritage Conservation Grant to install four new storefront awnings on the (South facing) street facade. A Conservation Plan is in place for the building located in the Trinity Royal Heritage Conservation Area. She recommended approval.

MOVED by Patrick McCaffrey, ***SECONDED*** by Donna Reardon to approve a Heritage Conservation Grant for 15% to a maximum of \$524.19 for the installation of the four storefront awnings.

Gord questioned that because Decimal 81 is a tenant to the building if the grant application should be handled differently. Acting Commissioner Amy Poffenroth explained that when a full review of the grant policy and procedures is conducted, situations such as commercial tenants and the maximum amount of grant money per PID will be evaluated as well.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.4A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-13
JIM BEZANSON, 114-116 WENTWORTH STREET

Alice Fudge advised the application is for the civic address of 116 Wentworth Street. She recommended approval:

- A. Replacement of non-original 3-in-1 tar shingles with slate shingles, and repair copper cornice, all on street façade (west) roof;
- B. Replacement of three (3) new wood windows on the lower level, west façade;
- C. Replacement of new wood window on the upper level (second storey units) on the east façade.

ITEM 5.4B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-13
JIM BEZANSON, 114-116 WENTWORTH STREET

MOVED by Patrick McCaffrey, *SECONDED* by Donna Reardon to approve the following:

Remove, the existing 3-in-1 asphalt shingles at the front (east) mansard roof to provide access to the wall for repairs; install ice and water shield membrane;

Install new slate masonry shingles, authentic black/charcoal in colour; ensure 5” slate is exposed to weather, and fastened with copper roofing nails;

Repair, and/or replace as necessary, any deteriorated portion of the copper cornice, use material to match the gauge and profile of the original roof edge detailing (copper);

Install three new wood windows at basement level, west facade; two casements (on north and south sides of bay window) and one vertical slider (center) wood windows to match the size, materials, sash configuration and detailing of the deteriorated original wood windows;

Install new wood window at second level, east facade;

Scrub all surfaces to be painted with TSP (tri-sodium phosphate); rinse thoroughly with clean water; allow surfaces to dry completely prior to painting (typically 3 days);

Prime and paint all new and existing wood components and windows using the previously approved colour scheme, in keeping with guidelines found in Practical Conservation Guidelines for *Paint & Colour*: HC-136 *Waterbury Green* (trim) and HC-133 *Yorktowne Green* (accent);

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before April 19, 2013.

Applicant Jim Bezanson discussed with the Board that the application is to rectify the Minimum Property Standards By-Law due to the leaking basement windows on the front façade at civic number 116 Wentworth. He explained that the City of Saint John made improper repairs to the sidewalk fronting onto his property and that it was creating water damage to his property. The Board advised that he should contact his Council representative and express his concerns.

CARRIED

**ITEM 5.4C APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE CONSERVATION GRANT 13-13
JIM BEZANSON, 114-116 WENTWORTH STREET**

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the application is for Heritage Conservation Grant Renewal 13-13 application to the Board and provided the Board with an outline of the previously approved work that was proposed to continue in 2013. A Conservation Plan [2011] is in place for the building located in the Orange Heritage Conservation Area.

It was noted that the maximum amount of grant funding per property (PID) is \$5,000.00 per year. There was a grant application for work at the same PID at the March 20, 2013 meeting for work at civic number 114 Wentworth Street which was tabled. She recommended tabling the application until further clarification is received from the Board with regards to grant approvals for multiple civic numbers on one PID.

MOVED by Donna Reardon, ***SECONDED*** by Patrick McCaffrey to table the application for a Heritage Conservation Grant for up to a maximum of \$5,000.00 based on the work outlined in Certificate of Appropriateness [13-09] & Certificate of Appropriateness [10-47] for 114-116 Wentworth Street, pending further clarification from the Board regarding grant approvals for multiple civic addresses on one property PID.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.5A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-14
CHIPMAN HILL SUITES, 71 SYDNEY STREET

Alice Fudge advised the application is for a previously constructed wood fire escape. She recommended approval.

ITEM 5.5B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-14
CHIPMAN HILL SUITES, 71 SYDNEY STREET

***Moved** by Donna Reardon, **Seconded** by Patrick McCaffrey to approve the following:*

Replace a section of existing wood fire escape with new wood construction, at west wall of the north extension of building. Include capped 6 x 6 (150 x 150 mm) posts with 3/4" chamfered edges, 2 x 2 (40 x 50 mm) railing balusters and 2x4" hand rail, in keeping with Stairs, Decks & Fire Escapes.

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before April 19, 2013.
4. The proposed work to be completed by August 31st, 2013.

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the fire escape had been constructed without a building permit to comply with heritage guidelines the applicant must add the decorative elements to the portion of the fire escape at the west wall of the north extension of the building, such as edging and ornamental caps.

CARRIED.

**ITEM 5.6A APPLICATION FOR RENEWAL OF HERITAGE CONSERVATION
GRANT 13-15
JIM BEZANSON, 191 PRINCESS STREET**

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the application is for a Heritage Conservation Grant Renewal 2013 [13-15] for work as previously approved on Certificate of Appropriateness [10-51] for the rehabilitation of the front entry, installation of new side exit doors, rehabilitation of existing basement windows and installation of a new basement window, construction of a new fire escape stair and a new rear deck, repair and clean the paint from the brick masonry foundation, and paint wood components. Mr Bezanson provided a detailed project estimate. A Conservation Plan is in place for the building located in the Trinity Royal Heritage Conservation Area. She recommended approval.

MOVED by Bob Boyce, SECONDED by Patrick McCaffrey to approve a Heritage Construction Grant based on the renewal of work outlined in the previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness 10-51 to a maximum of \$5,000.00 based on submitted project estimates.

Donna Reardon expressed her concerns around developing conflict of interest policy with regards to staff receiving grant money.

CARRIED.
NAY, DONNA REARDON.

**ITEM 5.7C APPLICATION FOR RENEWAL OF HERITAGE CONSERVATION
GRANT 13-09
JIM BEZANSON, 114-116 WENTWORTH STREET**

The Certificate of Appropriateness [13-09] which had originally been brought before the Board on March 20, 2013 and was tabled. The Board decided that until full attendance tabled pending a fuller discussion to be had by the Board. Board members discussed that a full attendance of the Board was necessary

MOVED by Patrick McCaffrey, SECONDED by Donna Reardon to table the application for a Heritage Conservation Grant, pending further clarification from the Board regarding grant approvals for multiple civic addresses on one property PID.

CARRIED.

ITEM 6.0 REPORTS

There were no reports.

ITEM 7.0 OTHER BUSINESS**ITEM 7.1 2012 HERITAGE AWARDS UPDATE**

Amy Poffenroth updated the Board that at the meeting of February 20, 2013, Board members had discussed a short list of potential award winners for 2012. At that meeting the Board had discussed each of the choices, provided feedback to staff and requested the staff report back their findings. The Board discussed potential recipients and requested that they be given time to review the feedback provided, the presentation and the pictures provided by staff.

MOVED by Elizabeth McGahan, SECONDED by Patrick McCaffrey that staff forward the April 3rd staff report, the presentation of potential recipients and a complete list of potential recipients along with photos for the Board to review.

CARRIED.

ITEM 7.2 REQUEST FOR PRESENTATION TO THE BOARD

The Board gave consideration to a letter received from Greg Paterson, 127 King Street East dated March 25th, 2013 expressing concerns with his grant application. Staff advised the Board that Mr. Paterson had been successful in receiving a grant although a receipt for labor had been received it was not a proper paid invoice and was not submitted with cancelled cheques as per requirements of the Grant Summary Form. After a lengthy discussion the Board decided to give consideration to the invoice submitted to the Heritage Division on March 10th, 2013 provided you submit a cancelled cheque(s) to support this paid invoice for labour at the subject property 127 King Street East.

MOVED by Bob Boyce, SECONDED by Elizabeth McGahan that pursuant to the requirements outlined in the Grant Summary form, we the Heritage Development Board are prepared to consider the use of 2013 Grant funding, should the applicant provide the appropriate documents such as a cancelled cheque to support the invoice provided.

CARRIED.

ITEM 8.0 NEXT MEETING

The next regular Board meeting will be held April 3rd, 2013, at 5:30 pm.

ITEM 9.0 ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned 7:27 PM



Amy Poffenroth, P.Eng, MBA
Acting Commissioner