

**HERITAGE DEVELOPMENT BOARD
OF
THE CITY OF SAINT JOHN**

WEDNESDAY, JULY 5, 2017

The meeting of the Heritage Development Board was held in the 10th Floor Boardroom of City Hall, commencing at 5:25 pm.

IN ATTENDANCE:

Bob Boyce, Chair
Shane Goguen, 1st vice Chair
Elizabeth McGahan, 2nd Vice Chair
Councillor Blake Armstrong
Patrick McCaffrey
Scott Rinehart
Melissa Wakefield

Amy Poffenroth, Deputy Commissioner
Alice Fudge, Heritage Officer
Taylor McIntyre, Recording Secretary
Alana O'Halloran, Heritage Consultant

REGRETS: Bob McVicar

ITEM 1.0 AGENDA

MOVED by Shane Goguen, SECONDED by Councillor Blake Armstrong to approve the agenda for the meeting of July 5, 2017.

CARRIED.

ITEM 2.0 MINUTES

MOVED by Elizabeth McGahan, SECONDED by Scott Rinehart to approve the minutes for the meeting of June 7, 2017.

CARRIED.

ITEM 3.0 BUSINESS ARISING

Chair Bob Boyce asked Councillor Blake Armstrong if he had any update on the King Street East lighting and street signs that were talked about in the previous meeting. He said he mentioned it to Tim at the Council Meeting and will be following up with him via email.

ITEM 4.0 INTRODUCTION OF APPLICANTS/GUESTS

Applicants and guests in attendance were Keith Brideau of Historica Developments for 41 Princess Street and 38 Grannan Street, Jim Stevens and Pam Munn for 188 Germain Street.

ITEM 5.0 APPLICATIONS CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

ITEM 5.1A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT # 2017-0627

HISTORICA DEVELOPMENTS, 41 PRINCESS STREET

Alice gave the Board an overview of the proposed heritage permit for 41 Princess Street. The applicant is looking to remove the existing non-original doors, install new double doors that fit the opening, black aluminum-clad with glass panel and paint surrounds. There are new tenants in the building and will be entering and exiting through this side entrance. Alice mentioned that this type of project typically wouldn't be brought to the Board but this situation is slightly different as they are changing the placement of the door.

Shane Goguen asked the applicant if the door is moving forward. Keith Brideau said that door has to be recessed at least 42" back to meet building code. There are two sets of moulding and they are setting the door back to the original moulding.

Chair Bob Boyce asked if the new door shorter than the existing. Mr. Brideau replied yes. The existing door is originally 9 feet in height but the replacement will be around 8 feet. It will be approximately 1-1.5 feet lower.

Alice asked Mr. Brideau how they plan on lowering the arch. He said it's not going to be easy to move it but the idea is to take the moulding and rebuild the new wall and cut the two sides about a foot and a half.

Alice asked if they could put a transom above the door. Mr. Brideau said that is possible. Alice mentioned that she could prefer for the height to be the same as the existing door.

Mr. Brideau suggests they could also leave the original alone and put the double door in back and remove the single door. He said it would be the easier and cheaper option.

Melissa said it would keep the integrity of the building.

ITEM 5.1B APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT # 2017-0627

HISTORICA DEVELOPMENTS, 41 PRINCESS STREET

MOVED by Scott Rinehart *SECONDED* by Patrick McCaffrey to approve:

"A Heritage Permit to leave the existing inner arch in its entirety, remove the inner single door and install a new black aluminum-clad double door with glass panel and transom window above where the existing door is located and paint surrounds."

CARRIED.

Chairman asked Mr. Brideau if he will have to put handrails on the stairs. Mr. Brideau says they have never been there but he engineered mentioned it to him.

ITEM 5.3A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT # 2017-0656

HISTORICA DEVELOPMENTS, 38 GRANNAN STREET

Alice provides the Board with a detailed description of the proposed work to the old Bustin's building. She said this is one of the last tenants to fill the space. The applicant is looking to install new metal and glass guards on an entry step.

Alice told the Board that the stairs are required for the new tenant to access the space. The concrete steps have already been installed. Historica Development and the City have gone through the process of a "Stop Up and Closure" of the street to decommission this small footprint of the step as right-of-way of the street. The Board is only considering the installation of the new guards.

The original stairs did not meet the National Building Code of Canada.

The proposed design would not be considered a traditional design for a Victorian era building. The new steps will be a continued use and a new use for the building. The original purpose of the door was a delivery and service door for Bustin's furniture.

This project is a Rehabilitation project; considering this is a new addition/development to a historic place, Alice referenced chapter 4.3.1 "Exterior Form" of the National Standards:

14. Designing a new addition in a manner that draws clear distinction between what is historic and what is new.
15. Designing an addition that is compatible in terms of materials and massing with the form of the historic building and its setting.
16. Adding new features to meet health, safety or security requirements with the least impact on the character-defining elements and overall heritage value of the historic building.

This side of the building would not be considered a character design element but it is important for the work to complement the building. The metal is appropriate for the time the building was constructed but the glass is more contemporary. It is obvious that this is a new addition to the site.

Alice recommends approval of the proposed work.

Mr. Brideau said they have done similar designs on the interior and it looks very good and complements the building. He understands it is not a traditional railing for 137 years ago. The new tenant has a design studio in the space and preferred having glass so she can see outside and have transparency when looking out.

Chairman asked Mr. Brideau what the size of the railing is. Mr. Brideau thinks they are 1-1.5", however, he didn't have exact measurements but said there is room to adjust.

Melissa said that the railings in the drawing looked clunky. Mr. Brideau said that the drawing isn't to scale and it looks bigger than what it would actually be.

Melissa also asked if the finish will be glossy or matte. Mr. Brideau said they haven't decided but asked what the Board would prefer. Melissa replied matte. Mr. Brideau said he will go with matte to match the paint on the door.

MOVED by Councillor Blake Armstrong **SECONDED** by Shane Goguen to approve:

“A Heritage Permit for the installation of new metal and glass guards on an entry step at 38 Grannan Street.”

CARRIED.

Mr. Brideau and Board members discussed the drain pipe along the building near the stairs and how it will be diverted to avoid the stairs.

Keith Brideau left at 5:50pm.

ITEM 5.4A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT # 2017-0659

TIM STEVENS, 188 GERMAIN STREET

Alice gave the Board an overview of the proposed work to the single-family dwelling at 188 Germain Street. The homeowners are doing extensive renovations to the interior of the house and are looking to do exterior renovations to complement their new interior. The application is for:

- A. The alteration of a rear window opening into a door; install new aluminum clad wood door with glass panel and transom. Construct new wood stairs as per guidelines.
- B. Remove wood structure from side of building; infill door opening with heritage brick and lime based mortar; maintain brick arch.
- C. C. Replace original wood window with new aluminum clad wood windows, awning style with transom; infill lower portion with wood panel.
- D. Install new aluminum clad wood windows, vertical sliding; infill lower portion with heritage brick and lime based mortar; reinstate sandstone still.
- E. Replace 6 original wood windows [three windows with three decorative glass transom] with new aluminum clad wood windows which do not match original.

Alice recommends approval of items A to D but recommends denial for item E due to the style and age of the window.

Mrs. Munn said the main reason for the proposed removal of the window is for aesthetic reasons. She doesn't like decorative glass and it wouldn't match the other new windows. She is also concerned that the current window is not airtight.

Mr. Stevens said the renovations are very expensive and they have made a lot of effort to salvage materials during the renovations. He said that in order to match the renovations, he would like the window removed. Mrs. Munn mentioned that they are the only ones that will see the window, with the exception of the neighbour.

Alice told the Board that due to the heritage value of the window and the fairly good shape of the window, she cannot support the proposal to remove it.

Elizabeth asks how old the top window panes are. Alice said that the house was built after the Great Fire of Saint John.

Chairman mentioned that he assumes the decorative glass is stained glass. Mrs. Munn clarifies that she has been told it is actually leaded and hand painted. Scott makes an assumption based on the type of decorative glass that it would have been constructed around 1910 or 1920.

Scott asked the homeowners if they would consider moving the windows to a different location in the house. Mrs. Munn said that she doesn't like the look of them but she is willing to preserve the windows however not in the current location.

Shane mentioned that staff denial is because they would be losing a character defining element.

Alice said yes also that the structure of the window if not bad enough to replace. She mentioned that the first step of heritage conservation is to repair before you replace.

Shane asked a question about the back windows regarding the division of the house and the location of the windows. Mr. Stevens said the house use to be owned by the Knights of Pythias and were required to add a security door.

ITEM 5.4B APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT # 2017-0659
TIM STEVENS, 188 GERMAIN STREET

MOVED by Shane Goguen ***SECONDED*** by Patrick McCaffrey to approve:

"A Heritage Permit for:

- A. The alteration of a rear window opening into a door; install new aluminum clad wood door with glass panel and transom. Construct new wood stairs as per guidelines.*
- B. Remove wood structure from side of building; infill door opening with heritage brick and lime based mortar; maintain brick arch.*
- C. Replace original wood window with new aluminum clad wood windows, awning style with transom; infill lower portion with wood panel.*
- D. Install new aluminum clad wood windows, vertical sliding; infill lower portion with heritage brick and lime based mortar; reinstate sandstone still."*

CARRIED.

Discussion continued regarding item E.

Shane asked if it is possible to remove the bottom three windows. Chairman said that the decorative windows are mainly only visible from the inside and maybe sometimes by the neighbours. He said that the Board has been lenient to Standards regarding the rear of buildings that are not visible to the public.

Patrick asked if they can be incorporated in the new window. Mrs. Munn replied she doesn't like the windows.

Scott asked if they could be incorporated in another location in the house.

Members discussed their options regarding preservation.

The windows are at the rear of the building, not street facing and are not located on a character defining elevation.

Members would like to see the windows preserved due to the rarity of leaded and hand painted windows in that condition.

MOVED by Shane Goguen **SECONDED** by Patrick McCaffrey to approve:

“A Heritage Permit for the replacement of 6 original wood windows [three windows with three decorative glass transom] with new aluminum clad wood windows which do not match original.”

CARRIED

Tim Stevens and Pam Munn leave the meeting.

ITEM 5.5A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT # 2017-0674
BOB MANNING, 54 ORANGE STREET

Alice provided the Board with an overview of the proposed heritage permit for 54 Orange Street. The application is for the demolition of a garage and reconstruction of a new garage of similar size, location and style. The demolition original garage and the installation of the new foundation have been completed without the proper permits in place.

Alice recommends approval for the proposed garage.

The new garage will be slightly taller than the original.

Members discussed infill standards they use as guidelines for their decisions for accessory buildings.

Scott asked for clarification of punitive action when work is started without a permit. Alice told the Board that the applicant is charged double permit fees for the building permit.

Alice said that she discussed with the contractor the possibility of a flat roof to match other similar structures in the area but they weren't open to that idea.

Blake questioned why the peak of the roof is so high.

Alice told the Board that the property owners want a gable roof for storage purposes.

Melissa brought up the idea that they could paint the garage all one colour to make it less eye-catching, almost disappear. She does not want the garage to pull focus when the house should be the focal point. Alice said that is definitely a possibility. She asked if the Board is concerned about the trim aspects of the design. Melissa said she likes the trim, that it adds texture to the building.

Shane Goguen leaves at 6:40pm.

Patrick wondered if they could alter it to look more like a coach house with a traditional window in the front peak. Alice mentioned the homeowners want storage in the upper portion of the garage.

Alice mentioned that the owner has no design considerations for the project. She mentioned that we don't have a firm policy when it comes to new accessory buildings. This type of by-law review will potentially come from the Neighbourhood Action Plan.

ITEM 5.5B APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT # 2017-0674
BOB MANNING, 54 ORANGE STREET

MOVED by Councillor Blake Armstrong *SECONDED* by Patrick McCaffrey to approve:

“A Heritage Permit for the demolition of a garage and reconstruction of a new 16’ x 20’ garage placed in the same location as the previous structure; wood clapboards, traditional style wood trim, metal overhead opening carriage style door, asphalt roof shingles.”

Discussion continued regarding the style of the garage. Alice asked if the Board is looking for a traditional style or modern style.

There was a discussion about decorative features.

CARRIED

ITEM 5.2A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT # 2017-0634
JAYME HALL, 116 PRINCESS STREET

Alice gave an overview of the proposed work for the installation of a new wrought iron gate. In the meantime, a temporary gate has been installed. A local wrought iron worker has crafted a new gate for the property. He is a third generation wrought iron worker from Saint John and he has a wrought iron design catalogue that was his great grandfather’s that he has been referencing. The design was selected from said book.

Alice is recommending approval based on the material and design of the addition.

ITEM 5.2A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT # 2017-0634
JAYME HALL, 116 PRINCESS STREET

MOVED by Scott Rinehart *SECONDED* by Elizabeth McGahan to approve:

“A Heritage Permit to craft and install a new wrought iron gate with Victorian style decoration; attached to the exterior brick wall of the building and adjacent building.”

CARRIED

ITEM 7.0 OTHER BUSINESS

Item 7.1 HERITAGE SERVICES: STAFFING TRANSITION PERIOD

Amy introduced Alana O’Halloran to the Board. Alana is an Intern Architect with exp. Architects. She will be working part-time with Growth and Community Development Services starting July 11, 2017 until Alice’s job has been filled. Alana will provide heritage support and help train the new Heritage Officer once the position has been filled. She will be on-site three days a week and has resources from exp that she will be able to use during her time with the City.

Melissa, who is an architect with exp, mentioned that Alana has worked on the Imperial Theatre restoration project so she is familiar with the terminology and ideas of heritage design.

ITEM 8.0 NEXT MEETING

The next regular Board meeting will be held Wednesday, August 2, 2017.

Amy advised the Board that there is a Neighbourhood Action Plan Summit July 6-8. The heritage portion of the summit will be Friday and Saturday morning.

Chairman Bob Boyce mentioned that it is Patrick McCaffrey's last meeting as a Board member. He has been on the Heritage Development Board for six years.

ITEM 9.0 ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business the meeting adjourned at 7:10 pm.



Alice Fudge
Heritage Officer,
Growth & Community Development Services