

**HERITAGE DEVELOPMENT BOARD
OF
THE CITY OF SAINT JOHN**

WEDNESDAY MAY 14, 2014

The meeting of the Heritage Development Board was held in the 10th Floor Boardroom of City Hall, commencing at 5:30 pm.

IN ATTENDANCE: Bob Boyce, Chair
 Patrick McCaffrey, 1st Vice Chair
 Elizabeth McGahan, 2nd Vice Chair
 Councillor Donna Reardon
 Gordon Hewitt
 Scott Rinehart
 Bob McVicar

Alice Fudge, Heritage Analyst
Amy Poffenroth, Deputy Commissioner

REGRETS: Chris Boudreau
 Colin Waldschutz
 Jill Good, Recording Secretary

ITEM 1.0 AGENDA

MOVED by Elizabeth McGahan, SECONDED by Gord Hewitt to approve the May 14, 2014 agenda as presented.

CARRIED.

ITEM 2.0 MINUTES

ITEM 2.1 MINUTES OF THE APRIL 30TH, 2014 REGULAR MEETING

MOVED by Bob McVicar, SECONDED by Scott Rinehart to approve the April 30th, 2014 regular meeting as circulated.

CARRIED.

ITEM 3.0 BUSINESS ARISING**ITEM 3.1 UPDATE ON HDB DISCUSSION OF PRACTICAL CONSERVATION
GUIDELINES: WINDOWS**

Chair Bob Boyce advised that the Heritage Development Board held a special meeting on May 7th, 2014 to discuss the Practical Preservation Guidelines and the Board's policy regarding the use of non-traditional materials for replacement windows and other features.

MOVED by Patrick McCaffrey, SECONDED by Gord Hewitt to approve the use of non-traditional materials on a Heritage building

It is proposed that non-traditional materials may be considered and used if one of the following circumstances exists:

- 1. new in-fill buildings;*
- 2. where traditional materials are no longer available;*
- 3. where the technical /craftsmanship no longer exists, e.g. slate shingles and installation;*
- 4. after due consideration for repair, restoration and reconstruction has been ruled out by the Heritage Officer.*

The use of non-traditional materials must replicate in detail the character defining elements of the original feature (windows, doors, mouldings, etc.). In the case of windows, aluminum clad wood windows are the only consideration at this time.

The use of non-traditional materials will be considered on a case by case basis for appropriateness, however will not be eligible for grant funding.

CARRIED.

Based on the physical window examples that were presented at the meeting (May 7th, 2014), the Board can support the use of aluminum clad window (by MARVIN Windows) provided it replicate the original design. In the course of time, the Board would be open to a presentation on other non-traditional materials or products to be considered for a Heritage Permit.

ITEM 4.0 INTRODUCTION OF APPLICANTS/GUESTS

- John Hazen, Hazen Investments was present representing Item 5.2 153 Sydney Street.
- Rick Watters, Design Art Signs was present representing Item 5.3 36 Water Street.

- Morgan Lanigan & Kale Harper of ACRE Architects were present representing Item 5.1 45 Grannan Street.

ITEM 5.0 CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS AND GRANTS

**ITEM 5.3A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2014-23
HISTORICA DEVELOPMENTS C/O RICK WATTERS, 36 WATER STREET**

Alice Fudge advised that the application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a new fascia sign, wood with surface applied graphic and raised moulded border, and storefront window decals. She recommended approval.

**ITEM 5.3B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2014-23
HISTORICA DEVELOPMENTS C/O RICK WATTERS, 36 WATER STREET**

MOVED by Patrick McCaffrey, *SECONDED* by Bob McVicar to approve the following:

Install new fascia sign, wood with surface applied graphic and raised moulded wood border to read:

- “FAMOUS BARBERSHOP”

Install new window logo decal on the interior of the storefront windows, centred on each window pane (four).

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John’s Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before May 28th, 2014.

Heritage Officer Alice Fudge advised that the proposed wooden fascia sign is 2’x12’, with lettering and images to be vinyl film with a 3” dimensional wooden border. Rick Watters indicated that there is existing wood mounted to the building which they will be able use to secure the proposed sign to the building, minimizing holes in the facade.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.2A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2014-21
HAZEN INVESTMENTS C/O JOHN HAZEN, 153 SYDNEY STREET

Alice Fudge advised that the application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a vinyl casement window in place of an existing original wood window to meet egress requirements at the rear of the building. She recommended denial.

ITEM 5.2B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2014-21
HAZEN INVESTMENTS C/O JOHN HAZEN, 153 SYDNEY STREET

The applicant spoke about the need for the window replacement as a second exit and asked the Board if the location of a window has ever been consideration, in regards to allowing for non-traditional (vinyl in this case) windows to be installed. Mr Hazen explained that the location of this window is under a fire escape at the rear of the building where it is hidden from public view.

The Board clarified that the Standards do not make any distinction on location when considering replacement. It was recommended that the applicant explore the use of an aluminium clad wood casement window for this replacement application.

MOVED by Elizabeth McGahan, SECONDED by Gord Hewitt to deny the installation of a vinyl casement window; however in consultation with the heritage officer, an aluminum clad wood window with matching components would be considered an appropriate substitute.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.1A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2014-20
DEREK BILLINGSLEY C/O ACRE ARCHITECTS,
45 GRANNAN STREET (87-91 GERMAIN STREET)

Alice Fudge advised that the application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness to reinstate the building's lane storefront for new use, which includes:

- A.** Remove non-original brick infill from window openings and installing new aluminum-clad wood windows to fit five (5) windows;
- B.** Remove non-original brick infill from door opening and installing a new aluminum clad wood slab door (fire exit door);
- C.** Replace existing steel door with new aluminum clad wood entry door with glass panel, sidelight window and transom window;
- D.** Replace existing non-original door (west façade) with new aluminum clad wood entry door with glass panel and sidelight window (to match main entrance).
- E.** Detail storefront with wood tongue and groove panel at storefront windows; all components to be painted black.

She recommended approval.

**ITEM 5.1B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2014-20
DEREK BILLINGSLEY C/O ACRE ARCHITECTS,
45 GRANNAN STREET (87-91 GERMAIN STREET)**

MOVED by Patrick McCaffrey, SECONDED by Gord Hewitt to approve the following:

- A. **Remove** non-original brick infill from former storefront windows (5) and doorway, at the ground floor level of South façade;
- B. **Install** five (5) new aluminium clad wood windows to fit existing window openings as per elevation drawings;
- C. **Install** new aluminium clad solid wood door with glass panel, sidelight and transom window at south façade entrance;
- D. **Install** new aluminium clad solid wood door with glass panel with sidelight on west façade entrance;
- E. **Install** vertical tongue and groove wood panelling and wood mouldings on south façade storefront; all wood components to be painted black;
- F. **Apply** pigmented (black) breathable sealer to non-original bricks at three upper infilled windows.

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before May 28th, 2014.

This application was brought back to the table to discuss the use of aluminium clad wood windows and doors in the new restaurant storefront. It was recognized by the chairman that the applicants have the approval of the whole design, but the treatment of the upper two arched windows was discussed again. As proposed, the replacement windows are not an appropriate size or configuration for the existing openings, however, approval was given for the whole rehabilitation scheme.

Applicants are required to provide revised drawings of the design to the Heritage Officer.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.4A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2014-24
STEPHANIE BELL, 182 PRINCESS STREET

Alice Fudge advised that the application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the repointing of the brick masonry wall, north façade; for the caulking of existing non-original windows; and the repointing of sandstone window surrounds; and the repointing of sandstone steps. She recommended approval.

ITEM 5.4B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2014-24
STEPHANIE BELL, 182 PRINCESS STREET

MOVED by Patrick McCaffrey, *SECONDED* by Bob McVicar to approve the following:

Remove loose and deteriorated mortar and brickwork, using rotary grinders **ONLY** on middle of horizontal joints - remove the remainder with hand tools - **DO NOT USE GRINDERS ON VERTICAL JOINTS** - Where possible, salvage for re-use any existing undamaged brick which require removal - Joints to be raked out not to exceed original joint width - Do not round corner edges of bricks; Front façade.

Replace spalled or damaged bricks with salvaged brick to match original brick in colour, size, and porosity;

Remove loose and deteriorated mortar around sandstone, using rotary grinders **ONLY** on middle of horizontal joints - remove the remainder with hand tools - **DO NOT USE GRINDERS ON VERTICAL JOINTS**;

Repoint existing bricks and repoint sandstone using lime-based mortar to match original colour, consisting of:

- 1 part White Portland (type 10- grey is not acceptable);
- 2 parts hydrated lime (high calcium soaked minimum 24 hours; dolomite-based lime, used for agricultural purposes, is not acceptable); and
- 8 parts screened sand. Mix the lime and sand to create roughage, or “rough stuff”, then add the White Portland just prior to use - Carefully match colour and texture of the original mortar;

Wash down masonry using a mild restoration cleaner [Sure Klean 600, or similar].

Remove existing putty from windows; caulk windows.

This work is to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Development Officer;
2. The Buildings & Inspection Services Department will be contacted for necessary permits;
3. No work shall commence until the expiry of a fifteen-day appeal period pursuant to Section 15(2) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Provincial Appeal Board on or before May 28th, 2014;
4. No work shall commence until a start-up meeting has been held on site with Heritage staff to review procedures;
5. A test area will be prepared for review by Heritage staff following the start-up meeting and before commencement of the work.

The Board discussed the importance of matching the mortar colour and joint size when repointing the brick façade. Mortar colouring was added to the item on the CoA Patrick highlighted the lime mortar mix portions indicated by the mason's report – the CoA is specific with the recipe. The chairman wishes to explore some literature on historic mortar colour mixes.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.5A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2014-25
ROBERT COES, 258 PRINCE WILLIAM STREET

Alice Fudge advised that the application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness to reconstruct a wood retaining wall under the front deck. She recommended approval. Buildings & Inspection Services is aware of the project and are addressing the structural aspects.

ITEM 5.5B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2014-25
ROBERT COES, 258 PRINCE WILLIAM STREET

*MOVED by Bob McVicar, SECONDED by Scott Rinehart to **table** the application for the proposed deck posts and retaining wall construction pending the submission of additional details and design.*

The Board expressed their concerns with the lack of detailing of the retaining wall design submitted with the application. They weren't convinced of the appearance/aesthetic of the wall.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.6A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2014-26
DEBBIE EDEN, 26-30 HORSFIELD STREET

Alice Fudge advised that the application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness to paint the entire building, which includes the wood decorative cornice, the concrete sills, exterior concrete walls, foundation walls and entry door. She recommended approval.

ITEM 5.6B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2014-26
DEBBIE EDEN, 26-30 HORSFIELD STREET

MOVED by Bob McVicar, *SECONDED* by Donna Reardon to approve the following:

Wash down masonry using a mild restoration cleaner [Sure Klean 600, or similar].

Scrub all surfaces to be painted with TSP (tri-sodium phosphate); rinse thoroughly with clean water; allow surfaces to dry completely prior to painting (typically 3 days);

Prime and **paint** all concrete components using a 3-colour scheme selected from an approved historic colour palette, in keeping with guidelines found in Practical Conservation Guidelines for Paint & Colour .

- Kendall Charcoal HC-166 (body)
- Onyx White 2133-10 (trim)
- Laurentian Red CC-152 (front door)

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before May 28th, 2014.

CARRIED.

ITEM 6.0 REPORTS

ITEM 6.1 UPDATE ONE 167-171 PRINCE WILLIAM STREET

Deputy Commissioner Amy Poffenroth advised that property at 167-171 Prince William Street has been given approval for first and second reading by Common Council for demolition under the Dangerous Buildings Program.

ITEM 7.0 OTHER BUSINESS

No Other Business.

ITEM 8.0 NEXT MEETING

The next regular Board meeting will be held May 28th, 2014

ITEM 9.0 ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 7:47pm.

Amy Poffenroth, P.Eng, MBA
Deputy Commissioner,
Growth & Community Development Services