

**HERITAGE DEVELOPMENT BOARD
OF
THE CITY OF SAINT JOHN**

WEDNESDAY MAY 28, 2014

The meeting of the Heritage Development Board was held in the 10th Floor Boardroom of City Hall, commencing at 5:30 pm.

IN ATTENDANCE:

Bob Boyce, Chair
Patrick McCaffrey, 1st Vice Chair
Chris Boudreau
Colin Waldschutz
Councillor Donna Reardon
Gordon Hewitt
Scott Rinehart
Bob McVicar

Alice Fudge, Heritage Analyst
Amy Poffenroth, Deputy Commissioner
Jill Good, Recording Secretary

REGRETS:

Elizabeth McGahan, 2nd Vice Chair

ITEM 1.0 AGENDA

Heritage Officer, Alice Fudge requested that Certificate of Appropriateness application 14-24 Robert Coes, 258 Prince William Street be added to the agenda.

The following items were added to the agenda under *Other Business*:

- 7.1 Letter to Common Council from Harold Wright
- 7.2 NB Museum- Expansion

MOVED by Gord Hewitt, ***SECONDED*** by Colin Waldschutz to approve the May 28, 2014 agenda as amended.

CARRIED.

ITEM 2.0 MINUTES**ITEM 2.1 MINUTES OF THE MAY 14TH, 2014 REGULAR MEETING**

MOVED by Scott Rinehart, *SECONDED* by Donna Reardon to approve the May 14th, 2014 regular meeting as circulated.

CARRIED.

ITEM 3.0 BUSINESS ARISING

There was no business arising.

ITEM 4.0 INTRODUCTION OF APPLICANTS/GUESTS

- Robert Coes was present representing Item 5.4- 258 Prince William Street.
- Peter Asimakos of Clover Realty and Don Sterritt of Smyth Design Inc. were present representing 5.1- 87 Canterbury Street.

ITEM 5.0 CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS AND GRANTS**ITEM 5.4A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2014-24
ROBERT COES, 258 PRINCE WILLIAM STREET**

Alice Fudge advised that the application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness to reconstruct a wood retaining wall under the front deck. She recommended approval.

**ITEM 5.4B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2014-24
ROBERT COES, 258 PRINCE WILLIAM STREET**

Alice Fudge advised that the application had been tabled at the meeting of May 14th, 2014 due to a lack of details regarding the proposed aesthetics and materials. Ms Fudge provided the Board with an updated drawing showing the location of the proposed deck posts and the wooden retaining wall. She explained that the proposed retaining wall will be built of 2x10 placed on edge and constructed in between the sleeper walls, trimmed with wood and then painted the same colour to match the house (sage green).

Applicant, Robert Coes discussed the location of the retaining wall, explaining that it will be set back approximately two feet from the location of the original retaining wall. He explained that the original retaining wall had been shingled and due to the climate and location of the property the design of wood on wood, it had rotted and he advised the Board that he did not wish to construct a retaining wall of the original design for this purpose.

The Board held a lengthy discussion and expressed their concerns that there remained a lack detail for the retaining wall design submitted with the application. They advised the applicant to provide details of the materials to be used and drawings of the final design and the application could be reconsidered at a future meeting. Donna Reardon expressed her opinion that she did not have any issues with the proposed

design and did not agree with other members that the original design must be replicated but did request more details on the materials to be used.

***MOVED** by Bob McVicar, **SECONDED** by Scott Rinehart to **table** the application for deck posts and the construction of a retaining wall pending the submission of details regarding the details of the materials to be used and drawings of the final design.*

CARRIED.

NAY, DONNA REARDON

ITEM 5.1A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2014-27
CLOVER REALTY C/O PETER ASIMAKOS, 87 CANTERBURY STREET

Alice Fudge advised that the application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of (39) new aluminum clad wood windows at the west and south façades of the building to replace original windows. She recommended approval.

ITEM 5.1B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2014-27
CLOVER REALTY C/O PETER ASIMAKOS, 87 CANTERBURY STREET

Remove thirty nine (39) original wood windows from west and south façades, first and second levels;

Install thirty nine (39) aluminium clad wood windows, to match the original design and configuration of the building's original windows: 6 over 6 vertical sliding windows, green in colour, to be installed into the original window frame; west and south façades, first and second levels;

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before June 12th, 2014.

Alice Fudge presented some history on past applications at 87 Canterbury Street. In 2007 the building was rehabilitated into a commercial office space, involving extensive masonry work, at that time the majority of the windows were restored (rear façade) and new replacement wood windows and entrances were installed (all windows on street façade and all windows on third level) as well as a complete interior renovation. The current application is for the replacement of 39 wooden windows which have failed since the restoration in 2007.

Peter Asimakos advised the Board that the building is experiencing significant heat loss and moisture on account of the poor performance of the single pane wood windows, just 5 to 6 years after complete restoration, he circulated photographic evidence to the Board. He explained that he is losing tenants due to the deteriorated windows and their proximity to workspaces explaining that tenants complained of frost, drafts and difficulty heating the space particularly in the areas with 3 meters of the exterior walls on the South and East elevations.

Alice Fudge advised the Board that she had requested that the applicant Mr. Asimakos contact a qualified professional to determine the viability of restoration before any decision to replace the windows is made. She advised that the staff recommendation was for tabling of the application, that as the Heritage Officer she was unable to determine with certainty that a second restoration is not possible for the subject windows. She explained that she had received the professional opinion prior to the meeting but did not have the chance to review it thoroughly.

Donald Sterritt, an Architect of Smyth Design Inc provided the written opinion and was present for the meeting. He stated that *“the desire to replace the older single glazed windows stems from several factors as follows: 1) The windows require a substantial amount of maintenance and upkeep due to the age and construction. 2) The joints and junctions of window components are not conducive to providing weather tight seals. While the windows are in relatively good condition for the function the building was initially designed for, that is, an early 1900’s warehouse they do not provide the level of protection for the elements that current office place standards dictate.3) The single glazing does not provide adequate heat retention for the interior space. The standard for windows in this climatic zone is double glazed units.”* In his opinion he stated that he could not say that all of the windows could not be repaired and he recommended that they all be replaced.

MOVED by Donna Reardon, SECONDED by Bob McVicar to approve the replacement and installation of thirty-nine aluminium clad wood windows at the west and south facades of the buildings, based on the professional opinion obtained by the applicant and following review of the Board’s policy:

Colin Waldschutz advised that according to the Board’s policy on windows, should restoration not be possible, replacement is the next course of action, replacing in kind irreparable windows based on physical and documentary evidence. Mr. Waldschutz questioned if the applicant had considered the use of storm windows, Mr Asimakos advised that storm windows would not create the seal required as many of the windows are warped. He provided a sample of the proposed windows an aluminum clad MARVIN Window inserts, to match the original design and configuration of the building’s windows, the configuration will be 6 over 6 vertical sliding windows and will be painted green in colour which will be installed into the original wood window frame.

A brief discussion ensued and Board members expressed their concerns for the future condition of the building should an alternative not be considered. Colin Waldschutz requested clarification on when heritage staff would be requiring a professional opinion because it would be difficult to say for certain that it was unbiased. Deputy Commissioner Amy Poffenroth explained that the determination to have the applicant obtain a professional opinion stemmed from the lack of staff resources and expertise, as well as the scope of the proposal. She explained that a written professional opinion would

not be the be-all end-all accepted by staff, that physical and documented evidence would be required as well. The Board discussed that it is policy that the use of non-traditional materials must replicate in detail, the character defining elements of the original feature (windows, doors, mouldings, etc.). In the case of windows, aluminum clad wood windows are the only consideration at this time. The use of non-traditional materials will be considered on a **case by case** basis for appropriateness however will not be eligible for grant funding.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.2A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2014-28
DAVID CURREN, 200 GERMAIN STREET

Alice Fudge advised that the application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the restoration of the front sandstone steps. She recommended approval.

ITEM 5.2B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2014-28
DAVID CURREN, 200 GERMAIN STREET

MOVED by Colin Waldschutz, *SECONDED* by Scott Rinehart to approve the following:

Repoint sandstone masonry joints as needed; level tops of steps;

Install new sandstone stair treads with bull-nose on each step.

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before June 12th, 2014.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.3A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2014-05A
HISTORICA DEVELOPMENTS, 89-91 PRINCESS STREET

Alice Fudge advised that the application is for an amendment to the Heritage Permit [Certificate of Appropriateness] 14-05 to include the installation of two new sandstone window sills at the newly restored arched windows. She recommended approval.

ITEM 5.3B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2014-05A
HISTORICA DEVELOPMENTS, 89-91 PRINCESS STREET

MOVED by Patrick McCaffrey, *SECONDED* by Scott Rinehart to approve the following:

Remove single wythe non-original brick infill from former storefront windows, at the ground floor level South facade;

Install restored wood arched windows at original storefront window openings;

Install two sandstone window sills (9' length, two pieces with center masonry joint), cut to match existing masonry sill style;

Scrub all surfaces to be painted with TSP (tri-sodium phosphate); rinse thoroughly with clean water; allow to dry completely prior to painting (typically 3 days);

Prime and paint all wood components using an approved colour scheme in keeping with guidelines found in Practical Preservation Guidelines for PAINT & COLOR to be consulted with the Heritage Officer.

Install five exterior lamps, 6x12" black metal canister-style;

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before June 12th, 2014.

Alice Fudge advised the Board that upon an in-progress inspection of the restoration and installation of two warehouse arched windows, that the material of the window sills which were being installed (concrete architectural block) was not appropriate. The applicant immediately rectified the issue under direction of the Heritage Officer and arranged to have new sandstone sills created to match the building's original window detail.

CARRIED.

ITEM 6.0 REPORTS

No Reports.

ITEM 7.0 OTHER BUSINESS**ITEM 7.1 LETTER FROM HAROLD WRIGHT**

Donna Reardon requested that the letter from Harold Wright which was submitted to the May 26th, 2014 Common Council agenda be circulated as part of the Heritage Development Board agenda package.

Amy Poffenroth advised the Board that the City operates under the *Unightly Premises and Dangerous Buildings and Structures By-law* which adopts the Municipalities Act, the tools to handle the demolition of a dangerous building is Section 190 of the Municipalities Act. She explained that there are limited resources available in terms of enforcement when handling a dangerous buildings case and the only remedy available to the City other than minimal fines is demolition.

Chris Boudreau expressed his concerns with the loss of heritage stock in the city and the potential for salvaging the front facade at the very least. The Heritage Development Board held a brief discussion and agreed that individually, members would review policies in other municipalities.

ITEM 7.2 NB MUSEUM EXPANSION

Bob indicated that he was interviewed by the Telegraph Journal earlier in the week regarding the potential expansion to the NB Museum. Alice Fudge advised the Board that although a formal application for the expansion of the NB Museum had not yet been submitted to the Community Planning office she and Chair Bob Boyce had been given a preliminary presentation by museum staff.

The preliminary presentation showed an infill addition to the Museum situated on an adjacent heritage designated lot, location and materials have not been formalized at this point. Alice explained that the Museum itself is not designated, but the expansion would be in the neighbouring park adjacent to the museum which is a part of the Heritage Conservation Area.

ITEM 8.0 NEXT MEETING

The next regular Board meeting will be held June 11th, 2014.

ITEM 9.0 ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 7:37 pm.

Amy Poffenroth, P.Eng, MBA
Deputy Commissioner,
Growth & Community Development Services