HERITAGE DEVELOPMENT BOARD OF THE CITY OF SAINT JOHN

WEDNESDAY APRIL 17TH, 2013

The meeting of the Heritage Development Board was held in the 10th Floor Boardroom of City Hall, commencing at 5:30 pm.

IN ATTENDANCE: Leona Laracey, Chair

Gordon Hewitt, 1st Vice Chair

Colin Waldschutz Alex Pesold Scott Rinehart

Amy Poffenroth, Acting Commissioner

Alice Fudge, Heritage Analyst Jill Flecknell, Recording Secretary

REGRETS: Patrick McCaffrey, 2nd Vice Chair

Councillor Donna Reardon

Elizabeth McGahan

Bob Boyce

Jim Bezanson, Secretary/Heritage Development Officer

ITEM 1.0 AGENDA

The following item was added for discussion under Applications of Certificates of Appropriateness and Grants:

5.6 Chipman Hill Suites, 2 Mecklenburg Street

The following items were added for discussion under Other Business:

7.2 Appeal: Randy Peters, 253 Charlotte Street

7.3 2012 Heritage Awards

7.4 Conflict of Interest

7.5 Grant Policy

MOVED by Gord Hewitt **SECONDED** by Colin Waldschutz, to approve the agenda as amended.

CARRIED.

ITEM 2.0 MINUTES

ITEM 2.1 MINUTES OF THE APRIL 3RD, 2013 MEETING

Chair, Leona Laracey advised that a correction be made with regards to the removal of the requirement for cement board Page 4 under 5.1C.

MOVED by Gord Hewitt, **SECONDED** by Scott Rinehart to approve the April 3rd, 2013 minutes as amended.

CARRIED.

ITEM 3.0 BUSINESS ARISING

There was no business arising.

ITEM 4.0 INTRODUCTION OF APPLICANTS/GUESTS

Keith Brideau of Historia Developments was present representing *Items 5.1 89-91 Princess Street & Item 5.2 91 Princess Street*.

Angela Campbell & Jim Wilson of the Saint John Imperial Theatre were present representing *Item 5.3 Saint John Imperial Theatre*, *24 King Square South*.

Don Hazen & John Hazen, Hazen Investments Ltd, were present representing *Item 5.4 Hazen Investments*, 78 *Prince William Street*.

Paul McDade & Mike Richard were present representing *Item 5.5 No. 2 Engine House*, 24 Sydney Street.

ITEM 5.0 CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS AND GRANTS

ITEM 5.1A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-15 HISTORICA DEVELOPMENTS, 89-91 PRINCESS STREET

Alice Fudge advised the application is for the installation of two new wood doors and side-light windows and paint to be approved through consultation with the Heritage staff. She recommended approval.

ITEM 5.1B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-08 HISTORICA DEVELOPMENTS, 89-91 PRINCESS STREET

MOVED by Colin Waldschutz, **SECONDED** by Gord Hewitt to approve the following:

Remove single wythe non-original brick infill from former storefront window, at the ground floor level South facade;

Install new wood storefront components at former storefront window, including four (4) chamfered wood mullions, and including two 3'x8" (915mm x 2440mm) true stile-and-rail wood entry doors, complete with large glazed panel, and one fixed transom windows above, as well as two storefront side light windows with hinged transom windows above and recessed wood panels below;

Scrub all surfaces to be painted with TSP (tri-sodium phosphate); rinse thoroughly with clean water; allow to dry completely prior to painting (typically 3 days);

Prime and paint all wood components using an approved colour scheme in keeping with guidelines found in Practical Preservation Guidelines for PAINT & COLOR to be consulted with the Heritage Officer.

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

- The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
- 2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
- 3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before May 2, 2013.

CARRIED

ITEM 5.1C APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE CONSERVATION GRANT 13-15 HISTORICA DEVELOPMENTS, 89-91 PRINCESS STREET

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the application is for a Heritage Conservation Grant is for the installation of two new wood doors and side-light windows. A Conservation Plan is in place for the building located in the Princess Street Heritage Conservation Area. She recommended approval.

MOVED by Colin Waldschutz, **SECONDED** by Alex Pesold to approve a Heritage Conservation Grant of 15% of costs up to \$1,350.00 for the installation of two new wood doors and side-light windows.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.2A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-16 HISTORICA DEVELOPMENTS, 91 PRINCESS STREET

Alice Fudge advised the application is for the installation of five new wood vertical-sliding windows to a non-original warehouse addition to the Hayward & Warwick building. She recommended:

- 1. Deny the application for a Heritage Permit [Certificate for Appropriateness] as submitted;
- 2. Approve a Heritage Permit [Certificate for Appropriateness] to install new wood vertical-sliding windows to the non-original warehouse addition in keeping with the elevations of the adjoining heritage building in a manner that is compatible with the building's style and window configuration. Applicant is to submit elevation drawings

Alice Fudge advised that Mr. Brideau intends on installing windows of the same style and dimensions as the heritage windows in the original building at 89 Princess, however she concluded that the configuration is not compatible with the building's style. She discussed with the applicant regarding the possibility of banking the windows in twos, using symmetry as per traditional window design. Understanding that the structure in which these proposed new windows shall be installed does not have historical significance, it exists within the Heritage Conservation Area; and is an addition to a prominent building within Saint John's built history, which warrants treatment that is appropriate for the building style of the adjoining building.

The Board held a lengthy discussion concerning the proposed placement of the new wood windows and agreed that the configuration was not in keeping with the building's style. Keith Brideau indicated that he was flexible and would be willing to make the appropriate changes to the elevations to meet the appropriate symmetry. Ms. Alice Fudge explained that she would require appropriate elevation drawings as well as dimensions of the proposed windows. Mr. Brideau agreed to provide Ms. Fudge with the required paperwork and the Board agreed that once this paperwork is received to concede approval to the Heritage Officers discretion.

MOVED by Colin Waldschutz, SECONDED by Gord Hewitt to approve a Heritage Permit [Certificate for Appropriateness] to install new wood vertical-sliding windows to the non-original warehouse addition in keeping with the elevations of the adjoining heritage building in a manner that is compatible with the building's

style and window configuration, on the condition that proper elevation drawings and the dimensions of the proposed wood windows are provided prior to construction and subject to the approval of the Heritage Officer.

CARRIED.

During the discussion concerning the proposed installation of five wood windows the Board discussed the grant policy regarding grant approvals for non-original heritage buildings as well as the definition of new infill property. In the August 27th, 2012 resolution of Common Council the parameters for administrating the Heritage Grant Program were approved by Council. Amy Poffenroth explained that it was understood that grant funding would no longer be allocated to new infill or additions to heritage properties because the grant program is focused on maintaining traditional character defining elements of a heritage building. The Board determined that more time was needed to review the changes to the Heritage Grant Program and review the application for 91 Princess Street.

MOVED by Colin Waldschutz, **SECONDED** by Gord Hewitt to table the application for a Heritage Conservation Grant [13-16] for 91 Princess Street, pending further clarification regarding grant approvals for non-original heritage buildings.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.3A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-17 SAINT JOHN IMPERIAL THEATRE, 24 KING SQUARE SOUTH

Alice Fudge advised the application is for the installation of six new wood entry doors, and replace bricks on the North (street) facade. She recommended approval.

ITEM 5.3B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-17 SAINT JOHN IMPERIAL THEATRE, 24 KING SQUARE SOUTH

MOVED by Alex Pesold, **SECONDED** by Gord Hewitt to approve the following:

Replace six entry doors with six new wood doors on the front facade;

Scrub all surfaces to be painted with TSP (tri-sodium phosphate); rinse thoroughly with clean water; allow surfaces to dry completely prior to painting (typically 3 days);

Prime and paint or stain all new and existing wood and metal components using the approved colour scheme (Doors: *Hodley* HC-65, Trim: *Tarry Town Green* HC-134) in keeping with guidelines found in Practical Conservation Guidelines for <u>Paint & Colour</u>;

Remove existing bricks from upper portion of the North facade using gentlest means possible - non-abrasive hand tools;

Install replacement brick, using bricks of similar size, porosity and colour; and lay new brick, using lime-based mortar, consisting of:

- 1 part White Portland (type 10- grey is not acceptable);
- 2 parts hydrated lime (high calcium soaked minimum 24 hours; dolomite-based lime, used for agricultural purposes, is not acceptable); and
- 8 parts screened sand

Mix the lime and sand to create roughage, then add the White Portland just prior to use; Carefully match colour and texture of the original mortar;

*Note: Measures or precautions need to be undertaken to ensure mortar is allowed to cure a minimum of 28 days at no less than 10 degrees and no greater that 28 degrees Celsius ambient temperature.

Install limestone replacement stone lintels as required, using stone of similar colour (Indiana limestone) – ensure new stones are appropriately anchored with the wall structure;

Wash down repaired masonry using mild restoration cleaner (Sure Klean 600 or similar):

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

- The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
- 2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
- 3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before May 2, 2013.

The Board held a lengthy discussion concerning the removal and replacement of the bricks to the front facade of the building. Board members expressed their concerns that the replacement bricks should be of the same style, size and porosity. Mr Wilson of the Saint John Imperial Theatre indicated that he could provide the Board with a sample of the brick to ensure the Board's approval. It

was agreed that the brickwork portion of the Certificate of Appropriateness be tabled until a sample can be reviewed.

CARRIED

ITEM 5.3C APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE MAINTENANCE GRANT 13-17 SAINT JOHN IMPERIAL THEATRE, 24 KING SQUARE SOUTH

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the application is for a Heritage Maintenance Grant, she explained that the Saint John Imperial Theatre does not have a Conservation Plan is in place for the building located in the Trinity Royal Heritage Conservation Area. Jim Wilson & Angela Campbell expressed that they wish to make application for a Conservation Plan to take advantage of the grant funding available for Conservation Grants. The Board indicated that they were in favour of the decision to table the Maintenance Grant application and explained that in order to be eligible no work shall commence prior to the submission of the Conservation Plan and application thereafter for a Conservation Grant for work outlined in [13-17]. She recommended approval.

MOVED by Alex Pesold, **SECONDED** by Gord Hewitt to table the application [13-17] for a Heritage Maintenance Grant pending the application for a Heritage Conservation Plan for which upon submission a Heritage Conservation Grant may be applied for.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.4A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-18 HAZEN INVESTMENTS LTD, 78 PRINCE WILLIAM STREET

Alice Fudge advised the application is for the removal of non-original ceramic tiles from the street façade, repairs to underlying sandstone, and the replacement of missing dentils at mid-level cornice. She recommended approval.

ITEM 5.4B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-18 HAZEN INVESTMENTS LTD, 78 PRINCE WILLIAM STREET

MOVED by Alex Pesold, **SECONDED** by Scott Rinehart to approve the following:

Remove existing non-original ceramic tile from the street facade using hand tools to reveal the underlying masonry. A professional must advise further repairs to the masonry;

Repair/replace dentils on mid-level cornice;

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

- 1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
- 2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
- 3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before May 2, 2013.

CARRIED

ITEM 5.5A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-19 NO. 2 ENGINE HOUSE, 24 SYDNEY STREET

Alice Fudge advised the application is to fully replace asphalt roof shingles.. She recommended approval.

ITEM 5.5B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-19 No. 2 Engine House, 24 Sydney Street

MOVED by Colin Waldschutz, **SECONDED** by Alex Pesold to approve the following:

Remove the existing asphalt shingles, make repairs as required to the roof deck and:

Install new black asphalt shingle roof assembly; and repair/replace metal flashings as needed

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

- 1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
- 2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.

3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before May 2, 2013.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.6A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-20 CHIPMAN HILL SUITES, 2 MECKLENBURG STREET

Alice Fudge advised the application is for foundation repairs to the sandstone entry steps. She recommended approval.

ITEM 5.3B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-20 CHIPMAN HILL SUITES, 2 MECKLENBURG STREET

MOVED by Colin Waldschutz, **SECONDED** by Gord Hewitt to approve the following:

Remove sandstone steps for inspection and rebuild foundation to support stairs;

Repair (re-instate to original position) sandstone stairs and stair buttress blocks at main entry – stone is to be re-installed and shimmed to level with wooden wedges;

Repair any broken sandstone (left buttress), using threaded stainless steel rods or stainless steel pins and epoxy resin;

Repair any large gaps at stair risers by inserting new piece(s) of sandstone, matching existing colour and texture (tooled with combing chisel) – mason to ensure inserted piece(s) are to be placed with correct bedding plane orientation and held in place by stainless steel pins and epoxy resin;

Remove loose and scaling/flaking sandstone, using gentlest means possible -brush and/or non-abrasive hand tools – DO NOT BLAST with sand or other particulate matter;

Wash down repaired masonry using mild restoration cleaner (Sure Klean 600 or similar);

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

 The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;

- 2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
- 3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before May 2, 2013.

CARRIED

ITEM 5.3C APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE MAINTENANCE GRANT 13-17 CHIPMAN HILL SUITES, 2 MECKLENBURG STREET

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the application is for a Heritage Conservation Grant for foundation repairs to the sandstone entry steps. A Conservation Plan is in place for the building located in the Trinity Royal Heritage Conservation Area. She recommended approval.

MOVED by Alex Pesold, **SECONDED** by Gord Hewitt to approve a Heritage Conservation Grant for 15% to a maximum of \$711.00 for foundation repairs to the sandstone entry steps.

CARRIED.

ITEM 6.0 REPORTS

There were no reports.

ITEM 7.0 OTHER BUSINESS

ITEM 7.1 REQUEST FOR PRESENTATION TO THE BOARD

The Board gave consideration to a letter received from Tim Jones of 181-183 Princess Street dated April 11th, 2013 expressing concerns with his grant application. Staff advised the Board that the results of the Compliance Review indicated that several conditions were not met in the case of Mr. Jones' property at 181-183 Princess Street.

1) The requirement to: Infill completely one (1) partially infilled former window opening, which aligns with these same fire-damaged windows at the upper level of the east side of the rear extension [181 Princess Street], and clad the infilled opening with wood shingles to match the existing original wood shingle siding – retain the original [window trim] drip cap as an indication of the window's former location and the original window configuration

2) The requirement to meet the Heritage Permit condition to obtain the necessary Building Permits as set out in condition 2) of the Certificate of Appropriateness. No Building Permits were issued or are on file for any of the Heritage Permit work including the replacing 5 windows.

The Board agreed with staff's decision to deny grant funding to Mr. Jones as several conditions were not met and Chair Leona Laracey indicated that she would write a letter to Mr. Jones denying the request for presentation and outlining the concerns of the Heritage Development Board.

MOVED by Colin Waldschutz **SECONDED** by Gord Hewitt that the Heritage Development Board have reviewed the letter of April 11th, 2013 received from Tim Jones, re: Denial of 2012 Heritage Conservation Grant for 181-183 Princess Street and uphold staff's decision to deny release of grant funding.

CARRIED.

ITEM 7.2 APPEAL: RANDY PETERS, 253 CHARLOTTE STREET

Amy Poffenroth advised the Board that an appeal of the decision to deny grant funding to 253 Charlotte Street had been received by the Heritage Department. She explained that this has been forwarded to the City of Saint John's Legal department and is being handled by City Solicitor Scott Brittain. Ms. Poffenroth advised the Board that she would keep them updated on the status of the application.

ITEM 7.3 2012 HERITAGE AWARDS

Amy Poffenroth requested direction from the Board with regards to the 2012 Heritage Awards. Following the April 3rd meeting the staff report, presentation of potential recipients and a complete list of potential recipients along with photos was circulated by email for review. Due to lack of compliance resulting in a low number of potential award recipients the Board felt that it was best to postpone this year's ceremony. Board members advised that the list of potential 2012 award winners could combined with 2013 applicants and be recognized during next year's presentation. The Board discussed the benefits of circulating a Construction Season letter which should outline the changes that were made to the Heritage Grant Program. It was suggested that perhaps a second letter could be circulated in the fall to those that have made a Heritage Grant application and provide them with a checklist to ensure their submission is complete.

ITEM 7.4 CONFLICT OF INTEREST POLICY

The Board held a discussion concerning the conflict of interest policy and discussed that it would be helpful to have the Legal department attend a meeting to advise new Board members of the policy. Gord Hewitt advised that he thought a

letter outlining the Board's request should be written to the City of Saint John's Legal department requesting a meeting. Board members agreed and discussed that the letter should include the request to clarify policy, governance and consistency in applying National Standards & Guidelines.

MOVED by Gord Hewitt **SECONDED** by Scott Rinehart that the Heritage Development Board writes a letter to the City of Saint John's Legal department requesting a meeting to discuss policy, governance and application of the National Standards & Guidelines.

CARRIED.

ITEM 7.5 GRANT POLICY

The Board briefly discussed the changes to the Heritage Grant program made by Common Council as outlined in the appendix of August 27th, 2012 council report. Amy Poffenroth advised the Board that she is in negotiations with a consultant to develop grant policy and proper parameters for administrating the program. Ms. Poffenroth explained the importance of ensuring that appropriate policy be developed to meet professional auditing standards. The Board expressed that they wish to provide their input to the project and the consultant. A subcommittee of Leona, Scott and Gord was created they will meet and develop written feedback which will then be provided to the consultant.

ITEM 8.0 NEXT MEETING

The next regular Board meeting will be held May 1st, 2013, at 5:30 pm.

ITEM 9.0 ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned 7:40 PM

Amy Poffenroth, P.Eng, MBA Acting Commissioner

Shoppentol