

**HERITAGE DEVELOPMENT BOARD
OF
THE CITY OF SAINT JOHN**

WEDNESDAY AUGUST 21ST, 2013

The meeting of the Heritage Development Board was held in the 10th Floor Boardroom of City Hall, commencing at 5:30 pm.

IN ATTENDANCE:

Leona Laracey, Chair
Gordon Hewitt, 1st Vice Chair
Councillor Donna Reardon
Scott Rinehart
Bob Boyce
Elizabeth McGahan
Alex Pesold

Jill Flecknell, Recording Secretary
Alice Fudge, Heritage Analyst

REGRETS:

Patrick McCaffrey, 2nd Vice Chair
Colin Waldschutz

Jim Bezanson, Secretary/Heritage Development Officer
Amy Poffenroth, Acting Commissioner

ITEM 1.0 AGENDA

MOVED by Gord Hewitt, SECONDED by Elizabeth McGahan to approve the agenda as circulated.

CARRIED.

ITEM 2.0 MINUTES

ITEM 2.1 MINUTES OF THE AUGUST 7TH, 2013 MEETING

MOVED by Scott Rinehart, SECONDED by Gord Hewitt to approve the August 7th, 2013 minutes as circulated.

CARRIED.

ITEM 3.0 BUSINESS ARISING

There was no business arising.

ITEM 4.0 INTRODUCTION OF APPLICANTS/GUESTS

Ian Swaton was present representing 145 King Street East, Bob Morgan was present representing 198 Princess Street and Rick Watters of Design Art Signs was presenting representing 43 Princess Street.

ITEM 5.0 CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS AND GRANTS**ITEM 5.1A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-51A
DESIGN ARTS SIGNS C/O RICK WATTERS, 43 PRINCESS STREET**

Alice Fudge advised that the application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a new projecting sign on the south side of the building. She explained that the applicant has submitted a revised drawing that is more in keeping with the Practical Preservation Guidelines for signage. She recommended approval.

**ITEM 5.1B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-51A
DESIGN ARTS SIGNS C/O RICK WATTERS, 43 PRINCESS STREET**

MOVED by Donna Reardon, SECONDED by Bob Boyce to approve staff recommendation to install a new 60" high x 14" wide wood-faced banner sign, using approved heritage colours to match building, installed on steel 2" tube bracket, painted black with letters oriented vertically.

At its meeting July 24th, 2013 Board members held a lengthy discussion and expressed their concerns with the location, size, material and colours of the originally proposed projecting sign. The application was then tabled and the Board requested that the applicant review the Practical Preservation Guidelines for signage.

Board members discussed the revised drawing submitted by Rick Watters on behalf of the applicant, Chris Grannan of Mexicala Rosa's, which Heritage Officer Alice Fudge explained was more in keeping with the guidelines. Rick Watters advised the Board that the design would be a printed vinyl painted on to a 1/2" plywood board of 5ft x1ft fastened into the masonry with a metal hanger.

Donna Reardon and Bob Boyce explained that because the revised design would be a vinyl printed on to plywood, they would prefer the originally proposed vinyl fabric, due to weight concerns and the potential for added stress to the brickwork of the building facade.

Chair Leona Laracey advised that in the past the Heritage Development Board has only approved the temporary use of banner signage for the celebrations at the Imperial Theatre. Ms. Laracey explained that she would like to see the Board conduct a review of the signage guideline in its entirety.

MOTION DEFEATED

Board members discussed the proposed revisions to the sign and determined that that the size, location and proposed colours of the sign were in keeping with the Practical Preservation Guidelines, but that they would prefer it be made from vinyl to minimize impact on the facade.

MOVED by Bob Boyce, **SECONDED** by Donna Reardon to approve the following:

Install new 60” high x 14” wide vinyl banner sign, using approved heritage colours to match building, HC-4 “Hawthorne Yellow” and HC-51 “Audubon Russet”. To be installed on steel 2” tube bracket, painted black. Letters oriented vertically to read:

- “COURT YARD”
- “PATIO”
- MEXICALA ROSA’S (logo)

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John’s Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before September 5th, 2013.

CARRIED

NAY, LEONA LARACEY & ELIZABETH MCGAHAN.

ITEM 5.2A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-53
IAN SWANTON, 145 KING STREET EAST

Alice Fudge advised that the application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a previously approved window replacement from CoA [10-61]; application to replace an existing vinyl window with a new vinyl window on the North (rear) side of the building. She recommended denial.

ITEM 5.2B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-53
IAN SWANTON, 145 KING STREET EAST

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the property located at 145 King Street is a two and one-half storey multi-unit building located in the King Street East Conservation Area.

She reviewed with the Board that in 2010, owner Mr. Ian Swanton, was approved for a heritage permit to cover the replacement of one window at the rear of the building with a wooden window on CoA [10-61] to meet egress requirements. The majority of the windows at the rear of the building were installed prior to the property’s Heritage designation in 2007. The replacement of the existing vinyl window as proposed has not been completed to date.

Ms. Fudge advised that Mr. Swanton had submitted a letter to the Board indicating his reasoning for the proposed variance to replace the existing vinyl window with another vinyl window.

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the National Standards & Guidelines does not support the use of contemporary materials such as vinyl however it provides for the replacement of “in kind materials”. Although the reference to “in kind material refers to the replacement of original character-defining elements, not replacement ‘in kind’ of non-original elements, such as the vinyl window. Ms. Fudge explained that the guideline supports the home owner taking the opportunity for restoration whenever possible, rather than replacing a vinyl window with another vinyl window.

***MOVED** by Donna Reardon, **SECONDED** by Gord Hewitt to deny the application for an amendment to an existing Heritage Permit [Certificate for Appropriateness] [10-61] to replace an existing non-original vinyl window at rear of building with a new vinyl window; the recommendation from CoA [10-61] shall remain.*

Mr. Ian Swanton presented to the Board photographs of the proposed window location and explained that he takes pride in being a part of the Heritage Conservation Area. He advised the Board he has faced several difficulties with the proposed window due to its location at the north side of the building where there is very little sunlight and that the Saint John climate have proven to be damaging to wood and paint on this particular side of the building.

Mr. Swanton explained that there are twenty windows at the rear of his building, seventeen of which are vinyl. He requested the Board to consider a variance for the one subject window to be replaced with vinyl instead of wood which he needs to replace to comply with the Minimum Property Standards By-Law. He provided the Board with cost estimates for both wood and vinyl. Mr. Swanton explained that as a real estate agent heritage designated properties in his experience are harder to sell, due to the perceived difficulties in following the Practical Preservation Guidelines and the increased cost to do so.

Board members held a lengthy discussion and determined that due to the location of the window at the rear of the building, the fact that the opening is non-original, that the majority of existing windows are vinyl and that the replacement is necessary to ensure compliance with the Minimum Property Standards By Law, the installation of a vinyl window in this instance could be approved. Leona Laracey explained that the configuration of the new vinyl window must be in keeping with the surrounding windows which is 9/9.

MOTION DEFEATED.

***MOVED** by Bob Boyce, **SECONDED** by Donna Reardon whereas the Minimum Standards By law requires an egress window, which is not in keeping with heritage details and where other windows are vinyl at the second storey of the rear facade of 145 King Street East, the Board is compelled to approve the substitution of materials and design.*

Remove existing vinyl sliding window on the rear north facade;

Install new vinyl casement window in the existing opening, mullions to match existing windows.

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before September 5, 2013.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.3A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-54
MAX MORGAN C/O BOB MORGAN, 198 PRINCESS STREET

Alice Fudge advised that the application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness to repair the fallen bricks from the third level decorative cornice and associated roof flashing and eaves trough repairs. She recommended approval.

ITEM 5.3B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-54
MAX MORGAN C/O BOB MORGAN, 198 PRINCESS STREET

MOVED by Donna Reardon, *SECONDED* by Scott Rinehart to approve the following:

Remove loose and deteriorated mortar and brickwork;

Replace spalled or damaged bricks with salvaged brick to match original brick in colour, size, and porosity;

Reconstruct cornice to match existing, including decorative elements; and

Repoint existing bricks/lay salvaged bricks; repair the north decorative cornice, using lime-based mortar, consisting of:

- 1 part White Portland (type 10- grey is not acceptable);
- 2 parts hydrated lime (high calcium soaked minimum 24 hours; dolomite-based lime, used for agricultural purposes, is not acceptable); and
- 8 parts screened sand

Mix the lime and sand to create roughage, or "rough stuff", then add the White Portland just prior to use

***Note: Measures or precautions need to be undertaken to ensure mortar is allowed to cure a minimum of 28 days at no less than 10 degrees Celsius ambient temperature. No work to be completed after October 31, 2013 (any work completed after this date will be ineligible for grant funding).**

Install new metal flashings and eaves trough.

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before September 5th, 2013.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.3C APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE MAINTENANCE GRANT 13-54
MAX MORGAN C/O BOB MORGAN, 198 PRINCESS STREET

Alice Fudge advised that the application is for a Heritage Maintenance Grant to repair the fallen bricks from the third level decorative cornice and associated roof flashing and eaves trough repairs. There is no Conservation Plan in place for the building located in the Princess Street Heritage Maintenance Area.

MOVED by Alex Pesold, SECONDED by Donna Reardon to approve a Heritage Maintenance Grant of 15% up to a maximum of \$500.00 based on project estimate to repair the fallen bricks from the third level decorative cornice and associated roof flashing and eaves trough repairs.

CARRIED.

The Board explained the benefits of having a Heritage Conservation Plan conducted for the subject property which would allow the owner to access larger grant funding.

ITEM 5.4A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-55
OLUGBENGA, OREDUGBA, 196 PRINCESS STREET

Alice Fudge advised that the application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness to repair the fallen bricks from the third level decorative cornice and associated roof flashing and eaves trough repairs. She recommended approval.

ITEM 5.4B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-55
OLUGBENGA, OREDUGBA, 196 PRINCESS STREET

MOVED by Donna Reardon, SECONDED by Alex Pesold to approve the following:

Remove loose and deteriorated mortar and brickwork;

Replace spalled or damaged bricks with salvaged brick to match original brick in colour, size, and porosity;

Reconstruct cornice to match existing, including decorative elements; and

Repoint existing bricks/lay salvaged bricks; repair the north decorative cornice, using lime-based mortar, consisting of:

- 1 part White Portland (type 10- grey is not acceptable);
- 2 parts hydrated lime (high calcium soaked minimum 24 hours; dolomite-based lime, used for agricultural purposes, is not acceptable); and
- 8 parts screened sand

Mix the lime and sand to create roughage, or “rough stuff”, then add the White Portland just prior to use

***Note: Measures or precautions need to be undertaken to ensure mortar is allowed to cure a minimum of 28 days at no less than 10 degrees Celsius ambient temperature. No work to be completed after October 31, 2013 (any work completed after this date will be ineligible for grant funding).**

Install new metal flashings and eaves trough.

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John’s Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before September 5th, 2013.

CARRIED.

ITEM 6.0 REPORTS

There were no reports.

ITEM 7.0 OTHER BUSINESS

ITEM 7.1 BOARD REVIEW OF PRACTICAL PRESERVATION GUIDELINES

Board members developed a subcommittee of Gord Hewitt, Bob Boyce and Heritage Officer Alice Fudge to review the Practical Preservation Guidelines for signage. The Board discussed the potential of reviewing the signage guideline particularly with regards to materials and size.

Gord Hewitt requested that staff review the Practical Preservation Guidelines for windows specifically with regards to the requirement for wood windows and conduct some general research on their manufacturing and durability. Heritage Officer Alice Fudge advised that due to current staff resourcing levels this research may have to be put on hold.

ITEM 8.0 **NEXT MEETING**

The next regular Board meeting will be held August 21st, 2013 at 5:30 pm.

ITEM 9.0 **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned 6:55 PM

Amy Poffenroth, P.Eng, MBA
Acting Commissioner,
Growth & Community Development Services