

**HERITAGE DEVELOPMENT BOARD
OF
THE CITY OF SAINT JOHN**

WEDNESDAY MAY 1ST, 2013

The meeting of the Heritage Development Board was held in the 10th Floor Boardroom of City Hall, commencing at 5:30 pm.

IN ATTENDANCE: Leona Laracey, Chair
 Gordon Hewitt, 1st Vice Chair
 Patrick McCaffrey, 2nd Vice Chair
 Councillor Donna Reardon
 Colin Waldschutz
 Scott Rinehart
 Bob Boyce

Alice Fudge, Heritage Analyst
Jill Flecknell, Recording Secretary

REGRETS: Elizabeth McGahan
 Alex Pesold

Amy Poffenroth, Acting Commissioner
Jim Bezanson, Secretary/Heritage Development Officer

ITEM 1.0 AGENDA

The following items were added for discussion under Business Arising:

3.1 Update on 181-183 Princess Street

The following item was added for discussion under Applications of Certificates of Appropriateness and Grant:

*5.10 Saint John Imperial Theatre, 24 King Square South
a) Conservation Plan Grant*

The following items were added for discussion under Other Business:

7.1 King Square Bandstand

7.2 Conflict of Interest Letter to Legal
7.3 Update from Grant Policy Subcommittee

It was requested that the applications for Historica Developments & Tom Bustin be moved up in the agenda as they were present for their applications.

MOVED by Patrick McCaffrey, **SECONDED** by Colin Waldschutz, to approve the agenda as amended.

CARRIED.

ITEM 2.0 MINUTES

ITEM 2.1 MINUTES OF THE APRIL 17TH, 2013 MEETING

Chair, Leona Laracey advised of a correction to page 11, item 7.4.

MOVED by Gord Hewitt, **SECONDED** by Scott Rinehart to approve the April 3rd, 2013 minutes as amended.

CARRIED.

ITEM 3.0 BUSINESS ARISING

ITEM 3.1 UPDATE ON 181-183 PRINCESS STREET

Chair Leona Laracey advised the Board that she had drafted a letter explaining the concerns of the Board and advising the applicant to apply. Staff has mailed the letter to the applicant.

ITEM 4.0 INTRODUCTION OF APPLICANTS/GUESTS

Keith Brideau of Historica Developments was present representing *Item 5.6 89 Princess Street, Item 5.7 85-87 Princess Street and Item 5.8 89-91 Princess Street.*

Tom Bustin was present representing *Item 5.3 30 Canterbury Street and Item 5.4 99 Germain Street.*

ITEM 5.0 CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS AND GRANTS

**ITEM 5.6A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-24
HISTORICA DEVELOPMENTS, 89 PRINCESS STREET**

Alice Fudge advised that the application is for:

1. the construction of a new building addition (a fourth level) which will accommodate a central elevator, and connect to the adjacent building, 85

- Princess Street; and the construction of a roof-top addition for the exit stair;
2. the construction of a new roof-top wood patio;
 3. the replacement of tar and gravel roof with new modified membrane roof;
- She recommended approval.

**ITEM 5.6B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-24
HISTORICA DEVELOPMENTS, 89 PRINCESS STREET**

The Board reviewed each of the proposed sections of the application separately.

1. *MOVED by Donna Reardon, SECONDED by Gord Hewitt to approve the construction of a new building addition (a fourth level) which will accommodate a central elevator, and connect to the adjacent building, 85 Princess Street; and the construction of a roof-top addition for the exit stair;*

The Board was in agreement with the proposed addition and requested that the applicant work with staff to ensure that proper metal cladding materials are used on the addition. The applicant agreed to review his decision with Heritage Officer Alice Fudge.

CARRIED.

2. *MOVED by Donna Reardon, SECONDED by Patrick McCaffrey to approve the construction of a new roof-top wood patio;*

Board members shared concerns that the installation of the proposed roof deck would not enable proper long term maintenance of the roof and could lead to detrimental effects on the building. Keith Brideau indicated that Historica Developments has taken this into account and that part of the application would be to replace the entire roof prior to the installation of the proposed rooftop deck and it would not be placed directly onto the roof but that there would be a space between the surface of the roof and the deck. Mr. Brideau explained that should repairs to the roof arise, boards will be lifted and the repairs will be done accordingly. Ms. Fudge noted that these design aspects would be addressed by the Building Inspection department, as they will receive and review the engineered drawings.

CARRIED.

3. *MOVED by Colin Waldschutz, SECONDED by Patrick McCaffrey to approve the replacement of tar and gravel roof with new modified membrane roof;*

Chair Leona Laracey, expressed safety concerns with regards to the proposed BBQ area located on the rooftop patio, she suggested that the applicant take precautionary measures such as the installation of increased fire protection in that

area. Mr. Brideau acknowledged the concerns and indicated that he would install potentially pavers or a metal plate around the BBQ area.

CARRIED.

Remove existing built-up roofing material to expose existing roof deck;

Repair, and/or replace as necessary, existing metal flashings with new material to suit the new roof assembly conditions and match original materials and detailing [colour of new metal flashings to be selected in consultation with heritage staff];

Install layer of recovery, or protection board;

Install new modified membrane roofing material;

Construct a new 1,900 square foot rooftop deck, complete with cedar tongue-and-groove perimeter railings/fencing, 6x6" posts, planter boxes, and lighting, as per attached sketches;

Construct new, 560 square foot addition at roof level to accommodate elevator mechanical space, central apartment stairs to fourth level, and access to the roof and new patio. Addition shall be built to submitted drawing specifications. Materials and exterior details, such as cladding, shall be finalized with Heritage staff;

Construct new, 64 square foot roof projection to accommodate secondary exit stairwell and access to the new patio. Addition shall be built to submitted drawing specifications. Materials and exterior details, such as cladding, shall be finalized with Heritage staff;

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
2. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before May 16, 2013.

CARRIED

**ITEM 5.7A APPLICATION FOR RENEWAL OF A
HERITAGE CONSERVATION GRANT 13-25,
HISTORICA DEVELOPMENTS, 85-87 PRINCESS STREET**

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the application is for the Renewal of a Heritage Conservation Grant for [CofA 12-80] for repairs to all original wood windows. There is a Conservation Plan in place for the building located in the Trinity Royal Heritage Conservation Area. Alice advised the Board that only one Certificate of Appropriateness [12-80] was issued for work to be done that encompasses two separate PID numbers [00008953 & 00008946]. She recommended approval.

MOVED by Colin Waldschutz, SECONDED by Gord Hewitt to approve the Renewal of a Heritage Conservation Grant for 25% to a maximum of \$5,000.00 for repairs to all original wood windows at 85-87 Princess Street [PID 00008953].

CARRIED.

**ITEM 5.8A APPLICATION FOR RENEWAL OF A
HERITAGE CONSERVATION GRANT 13-26,
HISTORICA DEVELOPMENTS, 89-91 PRINCESS STREET**

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the application is for the Renewal of a Heritage Conservation Grant for [CofA 12-80] for repairs to all original wood windows. There is a Conservation Plan in place for the building located in the Princess Heritage Conservation Area. Alice advised the Board that only one Certificate of Appropriateness [12-80] was issued for work to be done that encompasses two separate PID numbers [00008953 & 00008946]. She recommended approval.

MOVED by Donna Reardon, SECONDED by Bob Boyce to approve the Renewal of a Heritage Conservation Grant for 25% to a maximum of \$5,000.00 for repairs to all original wood windows at 89-91 Princess Street [PID 00008946].

CARRIED.

**ITEM 5.3A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-21
TOM BUSTIN, 30 CANTERBURY STREET**

Alice Fudge advised the application is for repairs to the parging at two locations on North side of building, facing Grannan Lane. She recommended approval.

**ITEM 5.3B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-21
TOM BUSTIN, 30 CANTERBURY STREET**

MOVED by Donna Reardon, SECONDED by Patrick McCaffrey to approve the following:

Remove loose and deteriorated mortar and brickwork, using rotary grinders ONLY on middle of horizontal joints – location of joints will need to be carefully determined as many of the joints are obscured by parging - remove the remainder of the mortar and any loose parging with hand tools - DO NOT USE GRINDERS ON VERTICAL JOINTS - salvage for re-use any existing undamaged brick which require removal - joints to be raked out not to exceed original joint width - do not round corner edges of bricks;

Replace spalled or damaged bricks with salvaged brick to match original brick in colour, size, and porosity;

Apply masonry parging to selected areas of north wall;

Repoint existing bricks/lay salvaged bricks using lime-based mortar, consisting of:

- 1 part White Portland (type 10- grey is not acceptable);
- 2 parts hydrated lime (high calcium soaked minimum 24 hours; dolomite-based lime, used for agricultural purposes, is not acceptable); and
- 8 parts screened sand

Mix the lime and sand to create roughage, or “rough stuff”, then add the White Portland just prior to use - Carefully match colour and texture of the original mortar;

***Note: Measures or precautions need to be undertaken to ensure mortar is allowed to cure a minimum of 28 days at no less than 10 degrees Celsius and no greater than 28 degrees Celsius ambient temperature.**

Wash down masonry using a mild restoration cleaner [Sure Klean 600, or similar];

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John’s Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.

3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before May 16, 2013.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.3C APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE CONSERVATION GRANT 13-21
TOM BUSTIN, 30 CANTERBURY STREET

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the application is for a Heritage Conservation Grant for brick masonry repairs to (parging) on north wall. A Conservation Plan is in place for the building located in the Trinity Royal Heritage Conservation Area. She recommended approval.

MOVED by Bob Boyce, SECONDED by Donna Reardon to approve a Heritage Conservation Grant of 25% of costs up to \$875.00 based on the estimate provided for repairs to parging in two places on the north side of the building.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.4A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-22
TOM BUSTIN, 99 GERMAIN STREET

Alice Fudge advised the application is for masonry repointing on North side of building, facing Grannan Lane. She recommended approval.

ITEM 5.4B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-22
TOM BUSTIN, 99 GERMAIN STREET

MOVED by Donna Reardon, SECONDED by Patrick McCaffrey to approve the following:

Remove loose and deteriorated mortar and brickwork, using rotary grinders ONLY on middle of horizontal joints – location of joints will need to be carefully determined as many of the joints are obscured by parging - remove the remainder of the mortar and any loose parging with hand tools - DO NOT USE GRINDERS ON VERTICAL JOINTS - salvage for re-use any existing undamaged brick which require removal - joints to be raked out not to exceed original joint width - do not round corner edges of bricks;

Replace spalled or damaged bricks with salvaged brick to match original brick in colour, size, and porosity;

Repoint existing bricks and stone/lay salvaged bricks using lime-based mortar, consisting of:

- 1 part White Portland (type 10- grey is not acceptable);

- 2 parts hydrated lime (high calcium soaked minimum 24 hours; dolomite-based lime, used for agricultural purposes, is not acceptable); and
- 8 parts screened sand

Mix the lime and sand to create roughage, or “rough stuff”, then add the White Portland just prior to use - Carefully match colour and texture of the original mortar;

***Note: Measures or precautions need to be undertaken to ensure mortar is allowed to cure a minimum of 28 days at no less than 10 degrees Celsius and no greater than 28 degrees Celsius ambient temperature.**

Wash down masonry using a mild restoration cleaner [Sure Klean 600, or similar];

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John’s Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before May 16, 2013.

CARRIED.

**ITEM 5.4C APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE MAINTENANCE GRANT 13-22
TOM BUSTIN, 99 GERMAIN STREET**

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the application is for a Heritage Maintenance Grant for masonry repointing on North side of building, facing Grannan Lane. There is no Conservation Plan in place for the building located in the Trinity Royal Heritage Conservation Area. She recommended approval.

MOVED by Donna Reardon, SECONDED by Colin Waldschutz to approve a Heritage Maintenance Grant of 15% of costs up to \$500.00 based on the estimate provided for masonry repointing on North side of building, facing Grannan Lane.

CARRIED.

**ITEM 5.1A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE CONSERVATION GRANT 13-08A
CARL KILLEN, 159-161 ORANGE STREET**

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the application is for a Heritage Conservation Grant to remove existing/install new wooden clapboards to all sides of the building and paint in a previously approved heritage paint color. A Conservation Plan is in place for the building located in the Orange Street Heritage Conservation Area. She recommended approval.

MOVED by Donna Reardon, SECONDED by Scott Rinehart to approve a Heritage Conservation Grant of 15% of costs up to \$4,320.00 for the removal of existing/installation of new wooden clapboards to all sides of the building and to paint in a previously approved heritage paint color.

CARRIED.

**ITEM 5.2A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-20
PAUL TOBIAS, 237 GERMAIN STREET**

Alice Fudge advised the application is for the installation of [eight] new wood balcony decks, two on each of the four levels, at rear of apartment building. She recommended approval.

**ITEM 5.2B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-20
PAUL TOBIAS, 237 GERMAIN STREET**

Construct eight new 8' x 8' (95" x 100") wood deck balconies at the west side (rear) of the building, complete with 2x4" wood balusters, wood hand railings, and 6x6" posts with chamfered edges - see attached sketches;

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.
3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before May 16, 2013.

MOVED by Donna Reardon, ***SECONDED*** by Scott Rinehart to table the application:

The Board expressed concerns that the proposed deck will have aluminum checker plate decking, that the application was lacking design details for the balusters and hand rails, of the safety of the design and the height of the proposed structure. The Board requested that the owner review the application with Heritage staff and look for potential alternatives to the proposed aluminum checker-plate decking as well as provide additional detailed drawings of the balconies. The Board indicated to staff that they would strongly encourage the applicant to attend the next meeting, once the additional details have been submitted.

CARRIED.

ITEM 5.5A APPLICATION FOR A HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-23
HANSEN SIGNS, 14 KING STREET

Alice Fudge advised the application is to install a new projecting sign on an existing support pole. She recommended approval.

ITEM 5.5B APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-22
HANSEN SIGNS, 14 KING STREET

MOVED by Donna Reardon, ***SECONDED*** by Gordon Hewitt to approve the following:

Install new 38” high x44” wide circular projecting sign, complete with painted corporate wordmark and logo (see attached images) to read:

“*SECOND CUP*”
[6” high, upper case, serif font];

Sign to be painted Dark Brown (background), and White (lettering/logo)

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John’s Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.

3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before May 16, 2013.

Chair, Leona Laracey expressed concerns with the size of the signage stating that tenants in a building should have a smaller sign than that of the owner. Ms. Laracey explained that she would like to see consistency with the neighboring signs on the streetscape. Board members held a brief discussion and concluded that they were in agreement with the proposed sign application as it fits within the existing Practical Conservation Guidelines.

CARRIED.

NAY, LEONA LARACEY

(Colin Waldschutz declared conflict of interest for Item 5.9)

**ITEM 5.9A APPLICATION FOR AN AMENDMENT TO HERITAGE PERMIT 2013-27
CHRISTOPHER WALDSCHUTZ, 213 GERMAIN STREET**

Alice Fudge advised the application is to amend the pattern of the installation of brick pavers as set out in Certificate of Appropriateness 12-13A, the applicant proposes to change the pattern to a running bond pattern. She recommended approval.

**ITEM 5.9B APPLICATION FOR AN AMENDMENT TO
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 2013-27
CHRISTOPHER WALDSCHUTZ, 213 GERMAIN STREET**

MOVED by Patrick McCaffrey, SECONDED by Donna Reardon to approve the following:

Install brick pavers in a running bond pattern in the carriage access area to the east of the building at 42 Duke Street and to the west of the garage of the neighbouring building at 211 Germain Street. Ensure new work is permitted on the property.

This work to be carried out under the following conditions:

1. The proposed work shall be carried out using traditional detailing and materials as required under Section 8 of the Saint John Heritage Conservation Areas By-law and to the satisfaction of the Heritage Officer;
2. The City of Saint John's Buildings & Inspections Services Division be contacted for necessary permits, and no work shall commence prior to the issuance of any and all required Municipal permits, including building permits.

3. No work shall commence until expiry of a fifteen day appeal period pursuant to Section 70(3) of the Act, and providing no appeal is filed with the Assessment & Planning Appeal Board on or before May 16, 2013.

The Board expressed concerns around the applicant's right of way to install a pathway in the proposed location and requested that it be added to the Certificate of Appropriateness that the applicant confirm that the new work is permitted on the property.

CARRIED.

**ITEM 5.9C APPLICATION FOR A RENEWAL OF A
HERITAGE CONSERVATION GRANT 13-27
CHRISTOPHER WALDSCHUTZ, 213 GERMAIN STREET**

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the application is to renew a Heritage Conservation Grant for the installation of brick pavers as set out in Certificate of Appropriateness 12-13A and amended to be installed in a running bond pattern. There is a Conservation Plan in place for the building located in the Trinity Royal Heritage Conservation Area. She recommended approval.

MOVED by Patrick McCaffrey, SECONDED by Donna Reardon to approve a Heritage Conservation Grant of 15% of costs up to \$742.50 based on the estimate provided for the installation of brick pavers as set out in Certificate of Appropriateness 12-13A and amended in 13-27 to be installed in a running bond pattern.

The Board held a lengthy discussion concerning the approval of grant funding for landscaping. The Board noted that there were different viewpoints towards eligibility but that based on the fact that it had been previously approved the Board agreed to uphold their decision. The subcommittee of Leona, Gord and Scott created to discuss grant policy, noted that landscaping eligibility would be reviewed.

CARRIED.

(Colin Waldschutz re-joined the meeting)

**ITEM 5.10A APPLICATION FOR A
HERITAGE CONSERVATION PLAN GRANT 13-28
SAINT JOHN IMPERIAL THEATRE, 24 KING SQUARE SOUTH**

Alice Fudge advised the Board that the application is for a Heritage Conservation Plan Grant for the four-storey 'brick and concrete' Neo-Classical Revival building located at the south side of King Square in the Trinity Royal Heritage Conservation Area There is a Conservation Plan in place for the building

located in the Trinity Royal Heritage Conservation Area. She recommended approval.

MOVED by Colin Waldschutz, *SECONDED* by Patrick McCaffrey to approve a Heritage Conservation Plan Grant of 50% of costs up to \$1,000.00 based on the estimate provided.

CARRIED.

ITEM 6.0 REPORTS

There were no reports.

ITEM 7.0 OTHER BUSINESS

ITEM 7.1 KING SQUARE BANDSTAND

Board members were excited to learn of the announcement made at Common Council on Monday April, 29th, 2013 that an anonymous donor has come forward to restore the King Edward VII Memorial Bandstand in the Trinity Royal Conservation Area, King Square. Scott Rinehart requested that a letter from the Heritage Development Board of thanks and heartfelt appreciation be sent to all parties involved, including the donor, the Mayor, Saint John Common Council (for their acceptance), and the refurbishment team for this wonderful gift to the City of Saint John, and to its citizens.

ITEM 7.2 CONFLICT INTEREST

The Board discussed a letter drafted by Patrick McCaffrey requesting to meet with the City Solicitors office regarding Conflict of Interest and Board governance. Mr. McCaffrey agreed to forward to staff for formatting, and Chair Leona Laracey will sign and submit the letter to the City's Legal department.

ITEM 7.3 GRANT POLICY

Chair, Leona Laracey explained that the subcommittee for Grant Policy discussions had met and plan on meeting to continue their discussions around grant policy. Ms. Laracey advised that once Acting Commissioner, Amy Poffenroth has returned, the Board will have the chance for a fuller discussion.

ITEM 8.0 NEXT MEETING

The next regular Board meeting will be held May 15th, 2013, at 5:30 pm.

ITEM 9.0 ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned 7:20 PM



Amy Poffenroth, P.Eng, MBA
Acting Commissioner